

August 2013

Two Historiographical Studies in Musicology:
Josquin Des Prez, a History of Western Music, and
the Norton Anthology of Western Music: a Case
Study; & in Search of Medieval Irish Chant and
Liturgy: a Chronological Overview of the
Secondary Literature

Marianne Yvette Kordas
University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Follow this and additional works at: <http://dc.uwm.edu/etd>

 Part of the [Medieval History Commons](#), [Music Commons](#), and the [Other Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Kordas, Marianne Yvette, "Two Historiographical Studies in Musicology: Josquin Des Prez, a History of Western Music, and the Norton Anthology of Western Music: a Case Study; & in Search of Medieval Irish Chant and Liturgy: a Chronological Overview of the Secondary Literature" (2013). *Theses and Dissertations*. Paper 234.

TWO
HISTORIOGRAPHICAL STUDIES
IN MUSICOLOGY:

JOSQUIN DES PREZ, *A HISTORY OF WESTERN MUSIC*,
AND *THE NORTON ANTHOLOGY OF WESTERN MUSIC*:

A CASE STUDY

&

IN SEARCH OF MEDIEVAL IRISH CHANT AND LITURGY:

A CHRONOLOGICAL OVERVIEW

OF THE

SECONDARY LITERATURE

by

Marianne Yvette Kordas

A Thesis Submitted in
Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Music

at

The University of Wisconsin—Milwaukee

August 2013

ABSTRACT

TWO HISTORIOGRAPHICAL STUDIES IN MUSICOLOGY:

JOSQUIN DES PREZ, *A HISTORY OF WESTERN MUSIC*, AND *THE NORTON ANTHOLOGY OF WESTERN MUSIC*: A CASE STUDY

&

IN SEARCH OF MEDIEVAL IRISH CHANT AND LITURGY:
A CHRONOLOGICAL OVERVIEW OF THE SECONDARY LITERATURE

by

Marianne Yvette Kordas

The University of Wisconsin—Milwaukee, 2013
Under the Supervision of Professor Mitchell P. Brauner

STUDY ONE: This study examines the changes made to the biography and works of the Renaissance composer Josquin des Prez (c.1450-1521) through the eight editions of *A History of Western Music* and its associated score anthologies from 1960 to 2010. It is hypothesized that there are significant correlations between the changes made to Josquin's biography in musicological scholarship at large during the 1990s and the changes made to his life and works in the textbook.

STUDY TWO: The study of liturgy and chant in medieval Ireland not only informs our understanding of insular Christianity, but also illuminates the broader practices of the Church throughout the medieval world. This study provides a historiographical overview of the secondary literature on Irish chant and liturgy from 1881 to 2005.

À la mémoire de ma grand-mère,
Yvette (née Wasteels) Kordas
14 Mars 1927 – 22 Mars 2013



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1)	List of Tables	v
2)	Acknowledgements	vi
3)	Josquin des Prez, <i>A History of Western Music</i> , and <i>The Norton Anthology of Western Music</i> : A Case Study	1
	i. Works Consulted	30
	ii. Appendix: <i>NJE</i> work numbers.....	35
4)	In Search of Medieval Irish Chant and Liturgy: An Chronological Overview of the Secondary Literature...	36
	i. Works Consulted	61
	ii. Appendix: Selected Chronological Bibliography	67

LIST OF TABLES

JOSQUIN

TABLE ONE: <i>MASSES</i>	14
TABLE TWO: <i>MOTETS</i>	17
TABLE THREE: <i>CHANSONS</i>	23

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS



No undertaking as large as attempting two masters degrees at once – one in music history and the other in library science – is ever accomplished without the help and support of many family members, professors, colleagues, and friends.

Family

I should first like to thank my parents and grandparents for instilling in me at a young age a love of history, cultures, languages, and music. Being taken as a child to European castles, Early Music Now concerts, and the Bristol Renaissance Faire sparked a life-long interest in all things medieval and renaissance, as is evidenced in the two papers presented here.

Thanks are warranted to my father for encouraging my academic pursuits, and to my mother for driving me to all those violin lessons, and putting up with my early squeaking (and wailings when I didn't play things well), and for listening patiently to my rambling phone calls all these years. And for doing the final proofreading of both my papers. Any errors that remain are solely mine, not hers.

Many heartfelt thanks to Mamie and Papie, one for loving opera and playing the (sadly now defunct) WFMR Mystery Quiz and getting me interested in composer's lives and music, and the other for letting me earn money for music lessons by mowing the lawn and operating the Linotype at the printing shop – and for my beautiful Jiang violin.

My French grandparents, Mémé and Pépé, also merit recognition, one for the harmonica, and the other for the all the songs – “Le petit chat blanc,” “La vie en rose,” and an unforgettable rendition of “L'amour est un oiseau rebelle” from *Carmen* on a hot summer day when I was five, standing under the silver maple tree on the gravel driveway in front of the garage, in her navy blue polka-dot dress, pearls, and clip-on earrings. I miss both of you.

Andrews University

My professors and mentors from my undergraduate days at Andrews University in Berrien Springs, MI., helped shaped me personally, professionally, and academically.

Dr. Lilianne Doukahn helped solidify my love for music history with her challenging, fair classes. She encouraged my interests in musicology, made the excellent suggestion I should take German, and was long-suffering as she guided me through my honors thesis. Both papers presented here are the germinations of ideas first planted while I was under the tutelage of Dr. Doukahn.

Carla Trynchuk pushed me to excel and got my violin playing (and posture) into shape. I think I learned as much about courageous, solid living and caring about others as whole people as I did about repertoire, pedagogy, and technique. I also learned to always put compliments before criticism, both in and out of masterclass.

Linda Mack gave me a job, helped me find my professional calling as a music librarian, and has mentored me in ways too numerable to mention. I will be forever grateful for the time and energy she invested in my training – and for teaching me how to write a mean set of program notes.

Dr. L. Monique Pittman’s enthusiasm for English literature, critical thinking, and good writing is contagious. I’m glad I took Ren Lit – complete with tea and readings from the Elizabethan *Book of Common Prayer*– and decided I could handle graduate-level work.

University of Wisconsin – Milwaukee

I’m grateful to my many professors and advisors at the University of Wisconsin – Milwaukee. In the School of Information Science, Sharon Lake and Twyla McGhee have been caring and capable advisors who were always willing to listen and strategize. Sharon was especially instrumental in helping me meet my goals after having taken a deferred grade.

Dr. Xiangming Mu was extremely patient as I labored to finish my final project for his information retrieval class. The comparison study I did between Naxos Music Library Online and Classical Music Library informs my listening recommendations to students to this day. (I still owe you cookies).

Dr. Peter Lor shared his knowledge of good library management with warmth and clarity. I just referred to my lecture notes the other day for a strategic planning meeting, and often try to apply the principles I learned in

his class in managing my student workers and constructing my library budgets.

Dr. Hur-Li Lee was gracious and merciful and chose to accept my SOIS comps even though there was a problem with the dropbox and my second essay was a few minutes late.

Dr. Thomas Walker has been kind and insightful. I have enjoyed our conversations about early music, and value his guidance in selecting my classes and re-taking my SOIS exam. Many thanks belong to him as well for agreeing to be the second reader for my thesis equivalent. I am most appreciative.

In the UWM music department, Dr. Gillian Rodger challenged me intellectually in ways I never had before, and dared to me to risk failure in order to succeed. She also had the wisdom and kindness to not let me continue commuting forty-five minutes each way in the snow during the horrible winter of 2008, and let me live in the lemon-yellow “kingdom of spare ‘oom” until the semester was over. Any knowledge I have of the Food Network, Project Runway, grilled veggies with garlic sauce, or pre-vaudeville Broadway is thanks to her. (And her brownies are to die for).

Dr. Martin Rosenblum was an enthusiastic and effusive PA supervisor from whom I learned much about American popular music. I have a much better appreciation for Muddy Waters, Robert Johnson, and blues forms now than I did six years ago.

Dr. Timothy Noonan has been a model of careful, clear, dedicated teaching, and a helpful graduate advisor. I am glad he knows how to keep his records in good order so I can graduate.

Dr. Judith Kuhn is commended for putting up with me as her TA during an extremely rocky period in my personal life. I have gained a much deeper appreciation for twentieth-century music and Shostakovich from her, and have found that her guidelines on how to listen to the structures and textures of music have transformed how I listen to many different musical genres.

Last but not least, my highest thanks to Dr. Mitchell Brauner for being my wise and witty thesis advisor – and for prodding when he needed to. Who would have thought that the sixteen-year old attending his lectures on *Der Erlkönig* and Beethoven for the MYSO music history class would one day sit in his office working out her thesis? I have tried to omit needless words.

UWM Libraries

I think I learned as much working for the UWM Golda Meir Libraries as I did in my graduate library science classes. I am very grateful that I got to experience theory and application in parallel.

Rebecca Littman has been a fun, knowledgeable boss in the Music and Curriculum area who helped introduce me to the world of the Music Library Association. I appreciate having had mentorship for the past six years, her

ingraining in my mind that the edition numbers for collected works can be found at the back of composer's biographical entries in *New Grove*, and for showing me that it is ok to promptly leave the office at six to catch the bus. Maybe I can finally catch up on Dr Who and David Tennant's *Much Ado About Nothing* and *Hamlet* now that I'm done?

Linda Kopecky, Head of the Research and Instructional Support department, had enough faith to hire me as the department's first Information Literacy Instruction Practicum intern. Kate Ganski and Kristin Woodward provided me with practical experience and valuable feedback on my library instruction sessions. This year at Andrews University we are working to implement LibGuides, and what I learned from these three fine librarians about instructional design and technology is proving very helpful.

Kathy Loomis taught a clear, well-designed class on original cataloging. It was wonderful to have someone with such a diverse background and sense of humor teach what can be a very difficult and abstract subject.

Molly Mathias took the time to coach me through the résumé and interview process for my current position as Director of the Music Materials Center at Andrews University. She helped me polish my résumé and cover letter drafts, gave me ideas for intelligent questions to ask at my interviews, and generally helped me put my best foot forward.

**James White Library,
Music Materials Center, Andrews University**

My boss, colleagues, and student workers at the James White Library at Andrews University in Berrien Springs, MI, have all been absolutely fabulous during this past year. I greatly appreciate their understanding and support, and for tolerating my frequent, long absences from the MMC office as I've worked to complete my comprehensive exams and thesis project.

It is a pleasure to work for a Dean of Libraries like Larry Onsager who knows how to listen, problem solve, and somehow manage to find extra money in the travel and professional development fund even when there isn't supposed to be any left.

My thanks also to Provost Andrea Luxton for astutely understanding what a realistic timetable for finishing my degrees looked like, and for providing the financial incentive to do so.

My graduate workers Zachary Harris and Kelliean Nesbeth deserve high commendations for keeping the MMC running during my absences, and for their capable supervision of the undergraduate staff. I could not have successfully completed my master's degree requirements on schedule without being able to rely on such good employees.

Counselors

My counselors over the past few years also deserve some mention. Dr. JoAnne Graham and Dr. Perkins of the Norris Health Center listened patiently to my frustrations, helped me understand that several of my academic struggles were linked to clinical depression and anxiety, and facilitated finding the right medication to set me again on an even keel. Maria Wilson wisely convinced me to follow through on taking my music theory comp exam when I had planned. I'm glad I listened. And Dr. Rick Kosinski of Berrien Springs has proved a calm, thoughtful sounding board for successfully navigating the final stages of the research and thesis process. To all of them – thank you for your time and care.

Friends

It is said that friends are the family that you make. I would not have successfully completed my graduate studies without more than a little help from my friends. Thanks to Audrey Walker (née Taube) for staying my friend these past eighteen years and for the Wednesday night dinners. I promise I will call now that my studies are all over.

Lucy Lewis and her entire family merit my deepest thanks for feeding and housing me during my last year of college, and for continuing to be part of my life.

Carey Beth Pearson – whatever I've learned about opera, vocal *fach*, giving good hugs, and the inner conundrums of singers, I've learned from you.

Thanks for keeping your promise to stay in touch, and for getting me through my music history comps and the final stages of thesis drafting with live book-readings over the phone.

Heather May, I don't know how we've managed to keep talking all these years. Thank you for being tenacious. We'll have to visit when you get back from teaching English in Korea.

I don't think I could have passed my music history or music theory comps without the help and good company of my classmate Steph Lewin Lane. Thanks for keeping me accountable and on track, and for insisting on drilling the terms and listening examples. I will always fondly remember our chats about music librarianship, the fears and perils of interviewing for a job, Renaissance music, and rockabilly. Rooming together in Dallas for MLA was really enjoyable. We should go together again sometime.

Eleanor Peterson understood my vision for doing something socially with the UWM music history students as a group. All the brown-bag lunches together in the staff lounge of the library were fun, and we *did* manage to coordinate twenty-some schedules and hold a pizza outing.

Having my long-time friend Bonnie McLean as a part-time roommate at Bremen St. was a lot of fun. Thanks, friend, for all the commiserating, paper consultations, and for introducing me to Cempazuchi's on Brady – that virgin blood orange margarita was awesome! All the best on your doctoral comp exam in English at Marquette University next month.

Rachel Sauer always seems to know what's hoppin' in Berrien Springs. I enjoy bumming around with her, be it to the Berrien Springs Village Christmas open house, walking the trails at the Sarret Nature Center, attending concerts at the Howard Performing Arts Center, or making the rounds of the Sabbath potluck circuit. I'm glad that we get to spend more time together now that we both work at the same university. We should watch the 2009 BBC version of *Emma* together sometime soon.

Thanks to Matthew Meyer for often picking up the tab and letting us girls pay the tip in dollar-bill origami. You and Clara were absolute dears to make me supper and fill up my gas tank the day I found out that my grandmother had died. Waking up to the smell of homemade spaghetti sauce after a tear-soaked nap made me feel very loved and well looked after. P.S.: your Thai food rocks, and I suspect it will only get better after your new wok and gas burner stove arrive in the mail.

Living as someone's roommate for four years is no easy task, especially when during part of that time the person is rather grumpy and struggling with clinical depression. Hats off to Clara Logan for loving me anyway, and for supporting my academic endeavors in innumerable ways. We may not see eye-to-eye on a schedule for doing the dishes, but I will never forget the many hours you volunteered to listen to me hash out ideas, proofread my papers, and help me crunch data and run off photocopies. Nor do I think I could have finished my library science comps on time if you hadn't chosen to run back to

Dollar General on Locust St. and get my folder full of notes when I was exhausted beyond words. Behind the following pages of my thesis equivalent are many treasured memories – discussing the original version of the Josquin paper in Lucy and Carey’s living room five years ago, narrating the original chronology of the Irish paper to you when I needed help getting over writer’s block, you choosing to play typing-fairy and transcribe my Irish paper notes while I slept, and both of us sitting the other Monday in your grandmother’s living room double-checking my Josquin data. I couldn’t have done this without you. From the bottom of my heart – thank you. The burrito this morning was delicious.

Dr. Bruce Closser read a draft of the Irish paper and made many useful suggestions. Tiffani Grigsby has been a lovely neighbor and colleague, and has kindly allowed me to use her Wi-Fi network – an indispensable advantage when double-checking online references late at night.

Soli Deo Gloria,

Marianne Yvette Kordas
Berrien Center, MI
12 August 2013

*For God has not given us a spirit of fear,
but of power and of love and of a sound mind.*



2 Timothy 1:7,

NKJV

JOSQUIN DES PREZ,
A HISTORY OF WESTERN MUSIC,
AND *THE NORTON ANTHOLOGY OF WESTERN MUSIC:*
A CASE STUDY

Introduction

Since the publication of the first edition of *A History of Western Music* (*AHWM*) in 1960, it has become the leading textbook for undergraduate music history surveys in colleges and universities around the world. Between 1960 and 2010 its eight editions have been produced by a leading textbook publisher, W.W. Norton, and edited, in turn, by three reputable musicologists – Donald Jay Grout, Claude V. Palisca, and J. Peter Burkholder.

A History of Western Music and its companion, the *Norton Anthology of Western Music* (*NAWM*), are key texts for music history pedagogy, not only because they distill the musicological knowledge available at the time of each edition's publication, but also because they cover a seminal period in the development of musicology, one influenced by an influx of theoretical ideas from other disciplines, such as New Historicism, feminism, and critical theory.

For his part, Josquin des Prez has long been considered an important, if not *the* most important, Renaissance composer of the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries. But the story of his life and works is deeply

problematic. As Alan Atlas observed, while Josquin may be “the most intensely studied composer” of the sixteenth century, “the never ending research keeps us off balance: how will the next discovery alter our picture of the composer? Will it force us to revamp his biography, and will it further muddle our already shaky ideas about the chronology of his works and just what he did and did not compose?”¹ In the 1950s, and again in the 1990s, Josquin’s always-unsteady biography underwent drastic revisions, triggering major reevaluations of the chronology and canon of his works. Likewise, the life and works of Josquin des Prez as described in *AHWM* and *NAWM* have changed considerably since the first editions of each in 1960 and 1980, respectively.

Purpose, Methodology, and Structure

To date, I have not found any other study in musicology that applies a longitudinal, historiographical research approach to a major music history textbook’s narrative of a composer’s life and works. Yet in many other ways this study falls squarely into the tradition of reception history – the study of how a work of art, composition, or composer has been received over time. The current study is valuable for providing a model for examining the contexts in

¹ Alan W. Atlas, *Renaissance Music: Music in Western Europe, 1400-1600* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1998): 253.

which music history narratives are formed and taught, and for conducting further historiographical studies in musicology.

The current study examines the changes to the narrative of Josquin's life and works across the span of the first eight editions of *AHWM* and the first six editions of *NAWM*. The first section is an overview of the history of (and major changes to) Josquin's biography as discussed in the scholarly literature. The second section focuses on the changes made to Josquin's biography through the eight editions of *AHWM* between 1960 and 2010. In the third section, particular emphasis is placed on studying the inclusions, additions, deletions, or persistence of particular works of Josquin through the editions of *AHWM* and its associated anthologies. A total of eighteen works attributed to Josquin have discussed in *AHWM* between the first edition in 1960 and the eighth edition in 2010. Out of these, eight have appeared in *NAWM*, while several more pieces were drawn from in *The Historical Anthology of Music* and *Masterpieces of Music Before 1750* before the introduction of *NAWM* in 1980.²

² Archibald T. Davidson and Willi Apel, *Historical Anthology of Music, Volume I: Oriental, Medieval, and Renaissance Music*, rev. ed., Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1949; Carl Parrish, *Masterpieces of Music before 1750: An Anthology of Musical Examples from Gregorian Chant to J. S. Bach*, New York, Norton, 1951.

A History of Scholarship on Josquin

Perhaps the history of Josquin's life and works as portrayed in *AHWM* and *NAWM*, and the significance of the changes to those items throughout the editions, would be clearer if first an overview of the history of Josquin studies were given. From very early on in the study of music history, Josquin was regarded as the best composer of the Renaissance and the leading composer of the Franco-Flemish generation from around 1450. The nineteenth-century German scholar August Wilhelm Ambros, in his monumental *Geschichte der Musik*, declared that, in the history of music, Josquin was one of the first composers to show the "imprint of genius" and devoted over thirty pages to discussing and analyzing Josquin's music.³

One of the great strides forward for Josquin studies in the early twentieth century came when the Vereniging voor Nederlandsche Muziekgeschiedenis chose to sponsor Albert Smijers in the compilation of a collected works edition for Josquin. The first volume came out in 1921, and the last came out – two editors and several decades later – in 1969.⁴

³ August Wilhelm Ambros, *Geschichte der Musik*, 2nd ed., vol 3, (Leipzig: Leuckart, 1881): 203. On Josquin's genius, see Paula Higgins, "The Apotheosis of Josquin des Prez and Other Mythologies of Musical Genius," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 57 (2004): 443-510, and Jessie Ann Owens, "How Josquin Became Josquin: Reflections on Historiography and Reception," in *Music in Renaissance Cities and Courts: Studies in Honor of Lewis Lockwood*, ed. J.A. Owens and A.M. Cummings (Warren, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 1996).

⁴ See Willem Elders, "Report of the First Josquin Meeting: Utrecht 1973," *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 24 (1974): 20-82.

Meanwhile, in 1956, Claudio Sartori had published an article identifying Josquin as an adult singer, or *biscantor*, working in Milan from 1459 to 1472. This necessitated a change in Josquin's established birth year from 1450 to a decade earlier, circa 1440.⁵ Another turning point for Josquin studies came in when Helmuth Osthoff published the first comprehensive biography of Josquin – in two volumes. The first volume came out in 1962, the second in 1965. This biography was a monumental achievement in assembling and analyzing past scholarship, as well as in setting the tone for much of the Josquin research that came after it.

The 1971 Josquin Festival Conference, held in New York, New York, brought together the best scholars in the field, as well as many students, and spurred scholarship in this area. One of the most important things that came out of the conference were concrete plans for a new edition of Josquin's collected works, since it had become evident during the finishing of Smijer's series that new, systematic scholarship needed to be applied to the *oeuvre*. These plans eventually came to fruition as the *New Josquin Edition* (hereafter referred to as the *NJE*), which is still in progress.⁶

The next major development in Josquin studies came in the early and mid-1990s, when Sartori's proposition of a 1440 birth date and Josquin's role

⁵ Claudio Sartori, "Josquin des Pres cantore del Duomo di Milano (1459-1472)," *Annales musicologiques* 4 (1956): 55-83.

⁶ See Elders, "Report," 1974; and the "General Introduction" in each volume of the *NJE*.

as a *biscantor* at the Duomo in Milan was dislodged by new evidence. It was shown that the Josquin in Sartori's Milanese documents was a certain Josquin de Kessalia, not Josquin des Prez.⁷ This discovery required the recalculation – yet again – of Josquin's approximate birth year from circa 1440 back to circa 1450 (or even circa 1455) and once more threw his whole chronology (and canon) into question.⁸ Some of these discoveries were published as early as 1994, with the majority being published in 1996.⁹

Additional work published by Lora Matthews and Paul Merkley in 1998 and 1999 established that Josquin had family ties to Condé-sur-l'Escaut, a town now on the Franco-Belgian border, where he spent his last years and died in 1521. It was shown that he was the inheritor of property left to him by an aunt and uncle, and that his father's family name was Lebloitte, identified by the sobriquet "des Prez."¹⁰ Furthermore, Herbert Kellman has shown that there were at least two police officers with the distinctive "Lebloitte dit des Prez" surname combination based in Ath in the county of Hainaut during the 1390s and through the late 1440s. He postulates that the younger of the two officers named Gosse Leboitte dit des

⁷ Adalbert Roth, "Judocus de Kessellia and Judocus de Pratis." Paper read at the Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society, Baltimore, November, 1996.

⁸ See the first three chapters of David Fallows, *Josquin* (Turnhout, Brepolis): 2009, for his explanation of why he thinks a 1455 birthdate possible.

⁹ Lora Matthews and Paul A. Merkley, "Josquin Desprez and His Milanese Patrons," *Journal of Musicology* 12 (1994): 434–63.

¹⁰ Lora Matthews and Paul A. Merkley, "Iudochus de Picardia and Jossequin Lebloitte dit Desprez: the Names of the Singer(s)," *Journal of Musicology* 16 (1998): 200–226.

Prez is the same Gosse listed as Josquin's father in the documents naming Josquin the heir to his aunt and uncle's property.¹¹

David Fallows built and expanded on these discoveries to create a new, full-length biography of Josquin in 2009. Dedicated to fellow Renaissance scholar Joshua Rifkin, the book is fairly well balanced, offering Fallows's own views on controversial points, while also citing opposing opinions. It is especially useful for the chronologies and bibliographies in its appendices.

A History of *AHWM* and *NAWM*

The first edition of *AHWM* was written in 1960 by Donald Jay Grout, at the time a professor at Cornell University and the president of the American Musicological Society.¹² In his preface, Grout recognized that his was only one version of the history of Western art music, and that it represented only a small slice of the developments in music around the world through the ages. Rather than create his own anthology to accompany *AHWM*, Grout chose to refer readers to scores in already published anthologies such as *The Historical Anthology of Music (HAM)* and

¹¹ Herbert Kellman, "Dad and Granddad Were Cops: Josquin's Ancestry," in *Uno Gentile et Subtile Ingenio: Studies in Renaissance Music in Honour of Bonnie J. Blackburn*, ed. M. Jennifer Bloxam, Gioia Filocamo, and Leofranc Holford-Stevens, (Turnhout: Brepols, 2009): 186-187.

¹² Gaynor G. Jones and Claude V. Palisca, "Grout, Donald (Jay)," *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*, <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/11845> (accessed 29 July 2013).

Masterpieces of Music Before 1750 (MM). It is interesting to note that *MM* was also a Norton publication; perhaps this influenced Grout's decision about whether or not to create a separate anthology for *AHWM*.

Upon close evaluation, it seems that the biography of Josquin included in the 1960 edition of *AHWM* is indebted to the revised, 1959 edition of *Music in the Renaissance* by Gustave Reese, also a Norton publication. While Reese's discussion of Josquin's life and works is much more detailed and includes more extensive analysis of more compositions than Grout's, it appears that Grout drew some of his language and ideas for musical examples from Reese.

Both authors reported that Josquin had been a choirboy at St. Quentin, had worked for the Sforzas in Milan starting around 1474 or 1475, and served in the Papal chapel from 1486-1494, with occasional sojourns in Florence, Modena, and Ferrara. Both also agreed that Josquin had worked for Louis XII of France for a period of time before 1515, and had died in Condé in 1521. One of the few differences in the two texts is a slight disagreement on the date of Josquin's birth. Grout fully followed Sartori's premise of a 1440 birth date, while Reese amended the 1450 date found in the first edition of his book to 1445 for the revised edition – a compromise that agreed with the earlier work of Ambros.¹³

¹³ Gustave Reese, *Music in the Renaissance*, rev ed. (New York: W.W. Norton, 1959): 228; Grout *AHWM* 1960, 173.

The next two editions of *AHWM*, in 1973 and 1980, respectively, basically followed the pattern set forth in the first edition for Josquin's biography. There were only minor changes in wording and facts, such as the addition of the speculation that Josquin's birthplace was somewhere in the county of Hainaut on the Franco-Belgian border, and a solidification of the dates of Josquin's service to Louis XII as being from 1501-1503.¹⁴ The most significant innovation for the third edition was the introduction of *NAWM*, a companion anthology, edited by Claude V. Palisca.¹⁵ (Coincidentally, just a few years earlier, in his capacity as American Musicological Society president Palisca had been instrumental in helping Edward Lowinsky organize the 1971 Josquin Festival-Conference and had delivered the opening welcome for the event.)¹⁶

Due to ill health, Grout was not able to participate in the preparation of the fourth edition of *AHWM*. Palisca was asked by the publisher to assume authorship, and he released new, overhauled versions of the text and anthology in 1988, one year after Grout's death.¹⁷ There were several changes to Josquin's biography in this edition, including a more explicit articulation of

¹⁴ Grout, *AHWM* 1973, 195; Grout, *AHWM* 1980, 194.

¹⁵ Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1988, ix.

¹⁶ "The Opening Session," in Edward E. Lowinsky, ed., *Josquin des Prez: Proceedings of the International Josquin Festival-Conference held at The Juilliard School at Lincoln Center in New York City, 21-25 June 1971*. (London: Oxford University Press, 1976): 1-17.

¹⁷ Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1988, xi.

Sartori's idea that the composer had been a singer at the Milan cathedral between 1459 and 1472, and an expansion of his involvement with the Sforza family in the 1480s.

The fifth edition in 1996 as a whole was, according to Palisca, entirely rewritten.¹⁸ The biographical details for Josquin, however, remained relatively unchanged from the previous edition, although there were some changes to the included musical examples – alterations that are discussed in the next section of this study. Perhaps the most significant development for the fifth edition was the addition to the editorial team of J. Peter Burkholder, who created a study and listening guide to accompany the textbook and anthology.¹⁹

A sea change to Josquin's biography came with the sixth edition of *AHWM* published in 2001. While it appears that the evidence uncovered by Merkle, Matthews, and Roth in the mid-1990s was too new to be included in the fifth edition of *AHWM* in 1996, after six to seven years Palisca must have deemed their views solid enough to include in a textbook. Conceivably some of these changes were also due to the implementation of an editorial review board.²⁰ In any case, Josquin's birth date was changed to 1450 and the erroneously attributed years at Milan from 1459-1472 deleted. Instead,

¹⁸ Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1996, xii.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, xiii.

²⁰ Burkholder, *AHWM* 2001, xii.

Palisca listed Josquin as working for René of Anjou around 1477, at the Sforza chapel in Milan from 1484-89, and at the papal chapel from 1486 to 1494/5. The evidence for Josquin claiming his inheritance from his aunt and uncle in 1483 was also included. The most stable facts about the end of his life – that he had died in 1521 as the provost at Condé – remained the same as in previous editions.

Regrettably, Palisca died in January of 2001, leaving *AHWM* and *NAWM* to Burkholder. In 2006, Burkholder published new, completely re-conceived editions of each. Chapters were re-divided, and more effort was put into contextualizing the times, peoples, and places of each kind of music. For example, sections on American music were integrated into the text in their chronological places instead of being segregated into one section at the end of the textbook. An all color format was adopted, and composer biographies were put into vignettes, as were excerpted readings from historical sources. Also included were colored historical, political, and geographical maps that helped the reader navigate and contextualize a composer's world.

As for Josquin's biography, a 1450 birth date was maintained in the seventh edition, while the idea that Josquin may have been a choirboy at St. Quentin was reintroduced.²¹ The rest of the biography perpetuated the changes introduced in the sixth edition: that Josquin had worked in the south

²¹ Fallows rejects the idea the Josquin was either born or served as a choirboy in St. Quentin. See Fallows, *Josquin*, 14-21.

of France at Aix-en-Provence for René, Duke of Anjou, from sometime in the late 1470s until René's death in 1480; that he had then probably transferred, with the rest of the duke's singers, to the chapel of Louis XI at the Sainte Chapelle in Paris. Additionally, Josquin is described as working for the Sforza family in Milan from 1484-89, and then in the papal choir in the Sistine chapel starting in 1489 or later, before serving for a year – as the highest paid member of the ducal chapel – at the court of Ercole I d'Este in Ferrara.²² In 1504 Josquin left Ferrara and returned north. (*AHWM* says he may have been fleeing an episode of plague). Burkholder follows the evidence of both old and new scholarship in stating that from then on Josquin was provost at the church of Notre Dame in Condé-sur-l'Escaut until his death in 1521.

The eighth edition of *AHWM* in 2010 maintained, on the whole, the narrative set out by Burkholder in the seventh edition, with only a few inconsequential emendations. Overall, the changes to each edition from 1960 to 2010 seem to have been driven largely by editorial choice and interpretation as well as changes in the knowledge base of musicological scholarship at large.

²² Burkholder, *AHWM* 2006, 203; for an account of Josquin's years in the papal chapel, see Starr, "Josquin, Rome, and a Case of Mistaken Identity."

Works by Josquin in *AHWM* and *NAWM*

While each edition of *AHWM* is organized differently, with notable changes made by each new editor, the discussion of Josquin's music in all eight editions is centered around three main genres of composition: masses, motets, and chansons. Therefore, the following discussion is also structured in the same manner. While not cited in any edition of *AHWM*, in the following discussion *NJE* numbers are occasionally used to disambiguate works one from another. A full table of *NJE* numbers for the works discussed may be found in the Appendix.

Masses

Of the twenty masses ascribed to Josquin in the 2001 edition of *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, five are discussed in *AHWM* and *NAWM*, with some masses being consistently mentioned and others appearing, disappearing, and reappearing. The chosen masses illustrate various compositional techniques, although the examples of *cantus firmus mass*, *parody/imitation/derived mass*, and *paraphrase mass* sometimes change from edition to edition (See TABLE 1).

Three of Josquin's masses are represented in all eight editions of *AHWM*: *Missa L'homme armé*, *Super voces musicalis*, *Missa Hercules dux Ferrarie*. and *Missa Malheur me bat*.

The first work is used to link Josquin’s compositions to the older *cantus firmus* tradition, and there is a brief discussion of the ingenuity with which Josquin transposes the *L’homme armé* tune to the various degrees of the hexachord, but this is done without in-text musical incipits or reference to any anthology. (While not mentioned in the text, an excerpt of the Agnus Dei from this mass was available as *HAM #89*, an anthology that Grout referred to in conjunction with the motet *Tu pauperum refugiam*, discussed later on.)

MASSES	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	NJE
Missa Faysant regretz	x	x	x						x
Missa Hercules dux Ferrarie	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Missa L’homme armé... super voces (Agnus Dei)	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	o
Missa Malheur me bat	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Missa Pange Lingua - Agnus Dei	x	x							x
Missa Pange Lingua (Credo and Kyrie)						x	x	x	x

TABLE 1. Most of the masses named in an edition of AHWB are not cross-referenced in an anthology. The Agnus Dei from Missa L’homme armé...super voces is found in HAM; the Credo and Kyrie from the Missa Pange Lingua are found in the 1996, 2001, and 2010 editions of NAWB. While the NJE volume for Missa L’homme armé...super voces was not available for review at the time of writing, the other four masses are accepted in NJE as authentic.

An “x” is marked in the column for the edition of AHWB in which a work is included. Colored boxes indicate inclusion in an anthology: light green for HAM, terra cotta for MM, and yellow for NAWB. The colors up in the row for the AHWB edition numbers represent the three authors: Grout, Palisca, and Burkholder.

In the NJE column, green and an “x” mean that a work is accepted therein as authentic, dark blue and an “o” mean that the volume containing that work hasn’t been published yet, and gold and an asterisk (which mirrors the NJE’s own starring system) indicates that the work is regarded as an opera dubia. This color scheme is based on the one found in stoplights at street intersections; however, no blatantly “red” or spurious works are seen in this chart.

A brief mention of the *Missa Hercules* illustrates the technique of *sogetto cavato dalle vocale*, whereby solfege syllables are matched to the vowels of a word or phrase to create a musical motif that is used as a basis of a composition.

Throughout the editions, *Missa Malheur me bat* is used as an example of a parody or imitation mass. The first two editions refer to it as a parody mass, as does the third, but Palisca notes that perhaps “derived mass” would be a better term.²³ From the fourth edition on it is called an imitation mass. Regardless of the term used, all the voices in this type of mass are derived from a polyphonic source.²⁴

In contrast, each voice in a mass like *Missa Faysant regretz* is drawn from a monophonic source in one way or another. These types of masses are known as *paraphrase masses*.²⁵ *Missa Faysant regretz* appears as the example for this compositional technique in only the first three editions of *AHWM*.

²³ Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1980, 196.

²⁴ For an exposition of the terminological debate around this type of mass, see Lewis Lockwood, “Mass, §6, The Cyclic Mass in the Later 15th Century,” *Grove Music Online*, *Oxford Music Online*, <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/45872> (accessed 28 July 2013).

²⁵ Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1980, 196.

The Agnus Dei from the *Missa Pange Lingua* is cited in the first two editions of *AHWM* as “an incomparable prayer for peace.”²⁶ The Credo and Kyrie from the same mass are mentioned in editions six through eight and are accompanied by scores and additional commentary in the accompanying editions of *NAWM*. It is not clear why the Agnus Dei was dropped, nor why the Credo and Kyrie were later added. Perhaps this was simply a matter of editorial preference.

Overall, the examples used to illustrate Josquin’s masses remain fairly stable through the editions, though it is interesting to note the disappearance of *Missa Faysans regretz* after the third edition of *AHWM*, and the reintroduction of *Missa Pange Lingua* with different movements in edition six after a hiatus of three editions.

Motets

Josquin was arguably one of the most prolific and important motet composers of his generation, and his numerous motets show an astonishing array of compositional ingenuity and sensitivity to the motet texts. Thus, along with his masses, his motets form a central core of his *oeuvre*. Through the editions of *AHWM* and *NAWM*, there are a total of ten motets discussed (See TABLE 2).

²⁶ Grout, *AHWM* 1973, 204.

MOTETS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	NJE
Absalon fili mi	x	x	x	x					*
Ave Maria... benedicta tu	x	x	x						x
Ave Maria... virgo serena					x	x	x	x	x
Mittit ad virginem	x	x							x
Nymphes des bois/Deploration	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	o
Tu pauperum refugium	x	x							x
Tu solus qui facis mirabilia (sub for Bene.)			x	x	x				x
Virgo prudentissima	x	x							x
PSALM MOTETS									
De profundis					x	x			*
Dominus regnavit			x	x					*

TABLE 2. The motets discussed in *AHWM* show a relatively scattered pattern of inclusion.

While there is little discussion of its musical features, Josquin's motet *Nymphes des bois* or *Deploration sur le trepass de Johannes Ockeghem* is used in all eight editions of *AHWM* to show Ockeghem's importance as a composer and to link Josquin, Jacob Obrecht, and Heinrich Issac to the preceding generation of Northern composers.

Another lamentation, *Absolon fili mi* is presented in the first four editions of *AHWM* as a fabulous example of text-painting, and is based on King David's cry of anguish over the death of his son:

Absalon fili mi, quis det ut moriar pro te, Absalon? Non vivam ultra, sed descendam in infernum plorans (2 Samuel 18:33).

Grout notes in the first edition that "on the words 'but go down weeping to the grave' ... the voices descend not only melodically but harmonically, taking the music through the circle of fifths from G to E-flat," an innovative feature for the time.²⁷ But whether or not this work is truly by Josquin has become

²⁷ Grout, *AHWM* 1960, 182.

debatable, with some scholars removing it from Josquin's canon altogether.²⁸ This controversy may explain its disappearance when *AHWM* was completely rewritten for the fifth edition in 1996.

The first three editions of *AHWM* contain a fairly detailed discussion of an *Ave Maria* by Josquin, but it not clear which *Ave Maria* is meant, especially since there are at least three *Ave Marias* that are solidly ascribed to Josquin and several more that are *opera dubia*. The first two editions refer the reader to a score for this *Ave Maria* in *Masterpieces of Music before 1750*, but *MM* does no better than *AHWM* in specifying which *Ave Maria* is included. The discussion of this *Ave Maria* in the *AHWM* text becomes even murkier in the third edition of *AHWM*, when the citation to *MM* is dropped. But by comparing the *MM* score with the scores for the different *Ave Marias* in the *NJE*, I identified the *Ave Maria* in question as *Ave Maria...benedicta tu* (*NJE* 23.4). Also, by examining the *AHWM* text surrounding the *Ave Maria* attribution in the third edition and comparing it with the parallel section in

²⁸ See Douglas E. Thompson, "A Summary of Current Debates Regarding Josquin's Biography and the Attribution of *Absalon, fili mi*," *Choral Journal* 42 (2001): 25-32; Jaap van Benthem, "Lazarus versus *Absalon*: about fact and fiction in the Netherlands motet," *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis* 39 (1989): 54-82; Joshua Rifkin, "Problems of Authorship in Josquin: Some Impolitic Observations, With a Postscript on *Absalon, fili mi*," in *Proceedings of the International Josquin Symposium, Utrecht, 1986*, ed. Willem Elders (Utrecht: Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis, 1991): 45-52; Nigel S. Davison, "*Absalon, fili mi*, reconsidered," *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis* 46 (1996): 42-46; Honey Meconi, "Another look at *Absalon*," *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis*, 48 (1998): 3-29; Peter Urquhart, "Another Impolitic Observation on *Absalon, fili mi*," *Journal of Musicology* 26 (2009): 512-565.

the first two editions of *AHWM*, I was able to determine that the *Ave Maria* discussed in the third edition is also *Ave Maria...benedicta tu*.

The most famous *Ave Maria* by Josquin, *Ave Maria...virgo serena* (*NJE* 23.6), is included in editions five through eight of *AHWM*, and appears with score and commentary in the fifth and sixth editions of *NAWM*. This work is often considered one of the gems in Josquin's output, though there remains some ambiguity about its place in his chronology.²⁹

The motets *Mittit ad virginem* and *Virgo prudentissima* both receive brief mention in the first two editions of *AHWM*, while *Tu pauperum refugium* is treated in somewhat greater length. (Perhaps this is because it was available, and cited as so, in the first volume of *HAM*). *Tu pauperum* is mentioned as forming the *secunda pars* of a larger motet, but it is not stated which motet this is. It is actually part of *Magnus es tu Domine* (*NJE* 21.6).

When Palisca assumed the primary authorship of *AHWM* for the third edition, the selection of motets shifted. *Mittit ad virginem*, *Virgo prudentissima*, and *Tu pauperum refugium* were dropped in favor of *Tu solus qui facis mirabilia* and the psalm motets *Dominus regnavit* and *De profundis clamavi* were added.

Included in the first, second, and third edition of *NAWM*, *Tu solus* received extended discussion in *AHWM* editions three through five, but for

²⁹ See Joshua Rifkin, "Munich, Milan, and a Marian Motet: Dating Josquin's *Ave Maria...virgo serena*," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 56 (2003): 239-350.

some reason was dropped in edition six, even though Palisca was still listed as the main editor. Its interest as a motet rests partly on its *cantus firmus* being drawn from *D'ung aultre amer*, a chanson by Ockeghem used earlier in the textbook and anthology. Showing how the chanson was used by Josquin in *Tu solus* allowed Palisca to build on earlier sections of the textbook and demonstrate how composers incorporated earlier *cantus firmi* into their own works. It is also used as an example of the Milanese practice of *motteti missale*, whereby sections of the Mass were replaced with motets. Palisca suggests that *Tu solus* was used in this manner to replace the Benedictus and Osanna II in Josquin's *Missa D'ung aultre amer*, though not all scholars are convinced the latter work is authentic.³⁰ The question of attribution is further complicated by the shifting views of Josquin's relationship to Milan, and the dates he may (or may not) have been employed there.³¹

Palisca included the psalm motet *Dominus regnavit* in the third and fourth editions of *AHWM*, and the first and second editions of *NAWM*. At a time when *AHWM* stated Josquin's birth date as c. 1440, Palisca praised *Dominus regnavit* as

a late work that shows Josquin at his best both as an architect of antiphonal and imitative structures and as an interpreter of a sacred

³⁰ *New Josquin Edition, Critical Commentary*, vol. 22, ed. Bonnie J. Blackburn (Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 1987): 45.

³¹ See Rifkin, "Munich, Milan, and a Marian Motet" mentioned above, and also David Fallows, "Josquin and Milan," *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 5 (1996): 69-80.

text... free of any borrowed melody, Josquin [was] able to respond with his musical instincts to the text: its form, its words, and its content.³²

However, *Dominus regnavit* was dropped in favor of *De profundis* as the psalm motet example in *AWHM* editions five and six. The corresponding scores in *NAWM* were also changed. Perhaps this was partially due to the rampant problems of provenance and authenticity for *Dominus regnavit*, even though earlier scholars had accepted it.³³

Just as with the *Ave Marias*, there are several versions of *De profundis* that are ascribed to Josquin. The one used by Palisca is the low-clef version for four voices (*NJE 15.11*). While some have doubted that this *De profundis* is an authentic composition by Josquin, it is nevertheless a splendidly beautiful example of text painting, with the voices rising one by one “out of the depths” of the bass line.

The section on Josquin’ motets seems to have undergone more changes over the course of time than the section on his masses. This may be in part because the first few editions discussed the motets in two places – first in a short paragraph between the biographical sketch of Josquin and the section on his masses, and then in a second, separate section devoted to discussing

³² Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1980, 202.

³³ For a summary and bibliography on the debates about *Dominus regnavit*, see *New Josquin Edition*, Vol. 17, ed. Eric Jas (Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 2008): 9.

the motets as a genre – while later editions consolidated the discussion into one section and reduced the number of works mentioned.³⁴

Chansons

Josquin was heir to a rich tradition of secular chanson writing by Du Fay, Busnoys, Binchois, and Ockeghem. Out of more than sixty chansons recognized as authentic and another thirty regarded as dubious,³⁵ three of Josquin's chansons are discussed in the pages of *AHWM* in the course of its eight editions: *Adieu mes amours*, *Faulte d'argent*, and *Mille regretz* in both Josquin's setting for four voices and a later intabulation for vihuela of Josquin's work by Luis de Narváez.³⁶ (See TABLE 3).

The changes in the *AHWM* section on Josquin's chansons allow for a miniature case study of the editorial practice in the textbook. In Grout's original work, some of the chapter sections were somewhat disorganized or split up. Thus, several pages separated the section on Petrucci and the advent of music printing from the discussion of the *Odhecaton* and *Canti B* and *C*. Furthermore, the section on Josquin's chansons was included in the

³⁴ Compare Grout, *AHWM* 1973, 195, 199; Burkholder, *AHWM* 2006, 205.

³⁵ See the works list in Patrick Macey, et al., "Josquin des Prez," in *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*, <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/1447> (accessed March 12, 2013).

³⁶ See Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1980, 192-193; Burkholder, *AHWM* 2010, 209, 274.

discussion of the *Odhecaton* and actually preceded the section on his biography, masses, and motets.³⁷

CHANSONS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	NJE
Adieu mes amours	x	x	x	x	x	x			X
Faulte d'argent	x	x	x	x	x	x			(x)
Mille regretz - intabulation			x	x	x		x	x	x?
Mille regretz - orig.			x	x	x		x	x	x?

TABLE 3. *Adieu mes amours* was included in the text of AHWM for the first six editions, but never cited in an anthology. It is regarded as one of the most secure attributions in Josquin's canon.

Faulte d'argent appeared in the first six editions of AHWM with a citation to HAM #91, even after the introduction of NAWM in 1980 along with the third edition. It has not yet been released in the NJE series, however it is generally accepted as authentic.

Mille regretz has been the NAWM staple example of a Josquin chanson since the introduction of the anthology, minus one year (2001) when it was cut from both AHWM and NAWM for editorial reasons. The attribution for *Mille regretz* is problematic because stylistically it dates from the 1520s, right around the time of Josquin's death. Nevertheless Fallows and his team accepted it as probably authentic for the 28th volume of NJE under their direction, basing the ascription in part on the evidence from intabulations such as the one mentioned in AHWM and included in NAWM.

The changes in the *AHWM* section on Josquin's chansons allow for a miniature case study of the editorial practice in the textbook. In Grout's original work, some of the chapter sections were somewhat disorganized or split up. Thus, several pages separated the section on Petrucci and the advent of music printing from the discussion of the *Odhecaton* and *Canti B* and *C*. Furthermore, the section on Josquin's chansons was included in the

³⁷ Grout, *AHWM* 1960, 155-156; 171-183.

discussion of the *Odhecaton* and actually preceded the section on his biography, masses, and motets.³⁸

In his discussion of Josquin's chansons Grout chose to include as examples *Adieu mes amours*, a very securely attributed four-voice work,³⁹ and *Faulte d'argent*, an unusual but accepted five-voice work.⁴⁰ Perhaps some of the motivation for including *Faulte d'argent*, at least in the first two editions, before the introduction of *NAWM*, was that a score of it was available in the *Historical Anthology of Music*.⁴¹

In the third edition, Grout expanded the discussion of Josquin's chansons to include *Mille regretz*, and both Josquin's four-voice setting and a later intabulation for vihuela by Luis de Narváez were included in the first edition of *NAWM*.⁴² This is a curious choice. While *Mille regretz* is often regarded as one of Josquin's most beloved and frequently performed and

³⁸ Grout, *AHWM* 1960, 155-156; 171-183.

³⁹ Louise Litterick, "Chansons for Three and Four Voices," in *The Josquin Companion*, ed. Richard Sherr (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 348-349; Fallows, *Josquin*, 41-43.

⁴⁰ Laurence F. Bernstein, "Chansons for Five and Six Voices," in *The Josquin Companion*, ed. Richard Sherr (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 396-400; Fallows, *Josquin*, 332-335.

⁴¹ Davison and Apel, *Historical Anthology of Music*, vol. 1, 93-95.

⁴² Walter A. Clark, "Luys de Narváez and the Intabulation Tradition of Josquin's *Mille regretz*," *Journal of the Lute Society of America* 26-27 (1993): 17-52.

recorded works, its attribution remains problematic, with some scholars dismissing it from Josquin's canon altogether.⁴³

For the fourth and fifth editions of *AHWM*, Palisca let Grout's prose and structure from the first three editions stand as they were. Then, in the sixth edition, he reduced the size of the section on the *Odhecaton* and cut *Mille regretz* from both *AHWM* and *NAWM*.⁴⁴ This may have been in response to Louise Litterick's critique and dismissal of the piece the year before in *The Josquin Companion*, though it is not clear if this was the case.⁴⁵

When Burkholder assumed editorship for the seventh edition in 2006, he completely reorganized the chapter structure of *AHWM*. The section on the *Odhecaton* was merged with the section on music printing in a special "interlude" section between chapters seven and eight.⁴⁶ (Oddly enough, this section is not indexed in the front of the book – an inconvenience when trying to locate it.) Also, Burkholder moved the section on Josquin's chansons into a

⁴³ See: Litterick, 374-376; Fallows, *Josquin*, 338-342; *The New Josquin Edition*, vol 28, Critical Commentary, ed. David Fallows (Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 2005): 326-329; David Fallows, "Who Composed *Mille regretz*?" in *Essays on Music and Culture in Honor of Herbert Kellman*, ed. Barbara Hagg (Paris, 2001): 241-52; Joshua Rifkin, "Who really composed *Mille regretz*?" in *Studies in Honor of Edward H. Roesner*, ed. David Butler Cannata et al. (Middleton, WI: American Institute of Musicology, 2008): 197-208; Fabrice Fitch, "Who Really Knows Who Composed *Mille regretz*?" in *Essays on Renaissance Music in Honour of David Fallows: Bon jour, bon mois et bonne estrenne*, ed. Fabrice Fitch and Jacobijn Kiel (Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2011): 272-278.

⁴⁴ Compare Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 1996, 172-173; Grout and Palisca, *AHWM* 2001, 163.

⁴⁵ See Litterick, 2000, 374-376.

⁴⁶ Burkholder, *AHWM* 2010, 164-165.

more logical place, so that the discussion of Josquin's musical output – motets, masses, and chansons – followed the discussion of his biography.⁴⁷

These changes meant that the text blocks containing discussion of *Adieu mes amours* and *Faulte d'argent* were cut and discarded. Curiously enough, the section on *Mille regretz* was reinstated, albeit with some changes, and both the four-voice setting and the intabulation for vihuela again included in *NAWM*.⁴⁸ It is not clear why this was done, since both *Adieu mes amours* and *Faulte d'argent* have more secure attributions. Perhaps Burkholder had a special affinity for the piece; perhaps discussing it allowed him to build on previous work when including the intabulation for vihuela in a later chapter of *AHWM* on the rise of instrumental music during the Renaissance.⁴⁹ Also, its reinstatement may have been in response to the scholarship of David Fallows, who argued for the work's continued acceptance in Josquin's canon in both a 2001 article entitled "Who composed *Mille regretz*?" and in the critical commentary for the twenty-eighth volume of the *NJE*, published in 2005, just a year before the sixth edition of *AHWM* came out in 2006.

If so, it is particularly appropriate that the intabulated version for vihuela was included, since Fallows's view that *Mille regretz* is probably by

⁴⁷ Burkholder, *AHWM* 2010, 203-209.

⁴⁸ Burkholder, *NAWM* 2009, 227-230 and 362-363.

⁴⁹ Burkholder, *AHWM* 2010, ch. 12, specifically 274-275.

Josquin is based on how such transcriptions and intabulations fit into the transmission history – or “stemma” – of the work.⁵⁰ Considering the changes made around *Mille regretz* in both the sixth and seventh editions of *AHWM*, it is possible to see how the editors of *AHWM* could be very quick to respond to developments in scholarship at large – sometimes within a year if a new edition was forthcoming.

Not surprisingly, Burkholder maintained the changes he had made in 2006 to the section on Josquin’s chansons in the 2010 editions of *AHWM* and *NAWM*.

Conclusions

Out of Josquin’s eighteen compositions discussed in *AHWM* and *NAWM*, the section on his motets has undergone the most revision. In contrast, the section on his masses has remained fairly stable. The section on Josquin’s chansons was pared down from a discussion of three works for the first six editions to just one, *Mille regretz*, in the seventh and eighth editions. Despite the volatile nature of Josquin’s chronology and canon, most of the works mentioned in *AHWM* and *NAWM* are authenticated in *NJE*, with varying degrees of surety. In examining the works represented, it seems that the Grout, Palisca, and Burkholder made changes both for editorial reasons,

⁵⁰ Fallows, *Josquin*, 339.

such as length, and in response to wider debates about a particular work's authenticity.

With the uncovering of new documentary evidence, the biography of Josquin drastically changed in both the 1950s and in the 1990s. In comparing the differences between each edition, it seems that his biography in *AHWM* was regularly changed in response to these shifts in scholarship, often within an edition or two. The biographical section for Josquin in *AHWM* also saw significant changes when under the direction of a new co-author. This is especially evident in edition seven in 2006, when there was a convergence of a new co-author, Burkholder, with a body of recent, ground-shifting scholarly work.

Perhaps more importantly, it seems that the way Josquin's story is told has shifted in the past fifty years. In the first edition of *AHWM*, Grout reflected the pompous, heroic narrative espoused by Ambros – that Josquin was perhaps the first composer in history to have the imprint of genius – and championed Josquin as the Beethoven of his day.⁵¹ But with the complete upheaval and rearrangement of Josquin's biography in the 1990s, Josquin scholars were forced to completely reevaluate what they knew and how they told the story of “Josquin the great composer.” This is reflected in Burkholder's prose for the seventh and eighth editions of *AHWM*, where the tone is much humbler than in Grout's first edition. Burkholder admitted that

⁵¹ Grout, *AHWM* 1960, 183.

“Josquin’s biography has been clarified by recent research, but there are still gaps.”⁵² Burkholder’s narrative seems less fixated on proving genius, and more concerned with inviting the reader to consider the evidence through source readings and a transparent scholarly attitude about what is, and is not, known about a particular composer – in this case, Josquin. Overall, a historiographical study of the entries for Josquin in *AHWM* show both the contentious, malleable nature of his canon and chronology, as well as demonstrate the ways historical, musicological narratives are told differently now than in 1960.



⁵² Burkholder, *AHWM* 2010, 204 (vignette).

Works Consulted

Ambros, August Wilhelm. *Geschichte der Musik*. 2nd ed. Vol 3. Leipzig: Leuckart: 1881.

Atlas, Alan W. *Renaissance Music: Music in Western Europe, 1400-1600*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1998.

Bentham, Jaap van. "Lazarus versus Absalon: about fact and fiction in the Netherlands motet." *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis* 39 (1989): 54-82.

Bernstein, Laurence F. "Chansons for Five and Six Voices." In *The Josquin Companion*. Ed. Richard Sherr. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Burkholder, J. Peter, Donald Jay Grout, and Claude V. Palisca. *A History of Western Music*, 7th ed. New York: W. W. Norton, 2006.

_____. *Norton Anthology of Western Music*. 5th ed. Vol 1. New York: W. W. Norton, 2006.

_____. *A History of Western Music*, 8th ed. New York: W. W. Norton, 2010.

_____. *Norton Anthology of Western Music*. 6th ed. Vol 1. New York: W. W. Norton, 2009.

Clark, Walter A. "Luys de Narváez and the Intabulation Tradition of Josquin's Mille regretz." *Journal of the Lute Society of America*, 26-27 (1993): 17-52.

Davison, Archibald T. and Willi Apel. *Historical Anthology of Music, Volume I: Oriental, Medieval, and Renaissance Music*. Revised edition. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1949.

Davison, Nigel S. "Absalon, fili mi, reconsidered." *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis* 46 (1996): 42-46.

Elders, Willem. "Report of the First Josquin Meeting: Utrecht 1973," *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 24 (1974): 20-82.

- Fallows, David. "Josquin and Milan." *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 5 (1996): 69-80.
- _____. "Who Composed *Mille regretz*?" In *Essays on Music and Culture in Honor of Herbert Kellman*. Edited by Barbara Haggh. (Paris: Minerve, 2001).
- _____. *Josquin*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2009.
- Fitch, Fabrice. "Who Really Knows who Composed *Mille regretz*?" In *Essays on Renaissance Music in Honour of David Fallows: Bon jour, bon mois et bonne estrenne*. Edited by Fabrice Fitch and Jacobijn Kiel. (Woodbridge, UK: Boydell Press, 2011).
- Grout, Donald Jay. *A History of Western Music*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1960.
- _____. *A History of Western Music*. Rev. ed. New York: W.W. Norton, 1973.
- Grout, Donald Jay, and Claude V. Palisca. *A History of Western Music*, 3rd ed. New York: W.W. Norton, 1980.
- _____. *A History of Western Music*, 4th ed. New York: W.W. Norton, 1988.
- _____. *A History of Western Music*, 5th ed. New York: W.W. Norton, 1996.
- _____. *A History of Western Music*, 6th ed. New York: W.W. Norton, 2001.
- Higgins, Paula. "The Apotheosis of Josquin des Prez and Other Mythologies of Musical Genius." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 57 (2004): 443-510.
- Jones, Gaynor G. and Claude V. Palisca. "Grout, Donald (Jay)." In *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online*.
<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/11845> (Accessed 29 July 2013)
- Kellman, Herbert. "Dad and Granddad Were Cops: Josquin's Ancestry." In *Uno Gentile et Subtile Ingenio: Studies in Renaissance Music in Honour of Bonnie J. Blackburn*. Edited by M. Jennifer Bloxam, Gioia Filocamo, and Leofranc Holford-Stevens (Turnhout: Brepols, 2009): 186-187.

- Litterick, Louise. "Chansons for Three and Four Voices." In *The Josquin Companion*. Edited by Richard Sherr. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Lockwood, Lewis. "Mass, §6, The Cyclic Mass in the Later 15th Century." In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*.
<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/45872> (Accessed 28 July 2013).
- Lowinsky, Edward E., editor. *Josquin des Prez: Proceedings of the International Josquin Festival-Conference held at The Juilliard School at Lincoln Center in New York City, 21-25 June 1971*. London: Oxford University Press, 1976.
- Macey, Patrick, et al. "Josquin des Prez." In *Grove Music Online*. *Oxford Music Online*.
<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/1447> (Accessed March 12, 2013).
- Matthews, Lora and Paul. A. Merkley. "Josquin Desprez and His Milanese Patrons." *Journal of Musicology* 12 (1994): 434–63.
- _____. "Iudochus de Picardia and Jossequin Lebloitte dit Desprez: the Names of the Singer(s)." *Journal of Musicology* 16 (1998): 200–226.
- Meconi, Honey. "Another look at Absalon." *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis*, 48 (1998): 3-29.
- New Josquin Edition*. Vol. 17. Critical Commentary. Edited by Eric Jas.
 Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 2008.
- New Josquin Edition*, Vol. 22. Critical Commentary. Edited by Bonnie J. Blackburn. Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 1987.
- New Josquin Edition*. Vol 28. Critical Commentary. Edited by David Fallows.
 Utrecht: Koninklijke Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis, 2005.

- “The Opening Session.” In Edward E. Lowinsky, editor. *Josquin des Prez: Proceedings of the International Josquin Festival-Conference held at The Juilliard School at Lincoln Center in New York City, 21-25 June 1971* (London: Oxford University Press, 1976): 1-17.
- Osthoff, Helmuth. *Josquin Desprez*. 2 vols. Tutzing: H. Schneider, 1962-5.
- Owens, Jessie Ann. “How Josquin Became Josquin: Reflections on Historiography and Reception.” In *Music in Renaissance Cities and Courts: Studies in Honor of Lewis Lockwood*. Edited by J.A. Owens and A.M. Cummings. (Warren, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 1996): 271-80.
- Palisca, Claude V. *Norton Anthology of Western Music*. Vol. 1. New York: W.W. Norton, 1980.
- _____. *Norton Anthology of Western Music*. 2nd ed. Vol 1. New York: W. W. Norton, 1988.
- _____. *Norton Anthology of Western Music*. 3rd ed. Vol 1. New York: W. W. Norton, 1996.
- _____. *Norton Anthology of Western Music*. 4th ed. Vol 1. New York: W. W. Norton, 2001.
- Parrish, Carl. *Masterpieces of Music before 1750: An Anthology of Musical Examples from Gregorian Chant to J. S. Bach*. New York, Norton, 1951.
- Reese, Gustave. *Music in the Renaissance*. Rev. ed. New York: W. W. Norton, 1959.
- Reese, Gustave, and Jeremy Noble. “Josquin Desprez.” In *The New Grove High Renaissance Masters: Josquin, Palestrina, Lassus, Byrd, [and] Victoria*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1984.
- Rifkin, Joshua. “Who really composed *Mille regretz?*,” In *Studies in Honor of Edward H. Roesner*. Edited by David Butler Cannata *et al.* (Middleton, WI: American Institute of Musicology, 2008): 197-208.
- _____. “Munich, Milan, and a Marian Motet: Dating Josquin’s *Ave Maria...virgo serena.*” *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 56 (2003): 239-350.

- _____. "Problems of Authorship in Josquin: Some Impolitic Observations, With a Postscript on *Absalon, fili mi*." In *Proceedings of the International Josquin Symposium, Utrecht, 1986*. Edited by Willem Elders. Utrecht: Vereniging voor Nederlandse Musiekgeschiedenis, 1991. 45-52.
- Roth, Adalbert. "Judocus de Kessellia and Judocus de Pratis." Paper read at the Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society, Baltimore, November, 1996.
- Sartori, Claudio. "Josquin des Pres cantore del Duomo di Milano (1459-1472)." *Annales musicologiques* 4 (1956) : 55-83.
- Sherr, Richard, ed. *The Josquin Companion*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Sherr, Richard. "Introduction." In *The Josquin Companion*, edited by Richard Sherr (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000): 1-10.
- _____. "Chronology of Josquin's Life and Career." In *The Josquin Companion*. Edited by Richard Sherr (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000): 11-20.
- Starr, Pamela F. "Josquin, Rome, and a Case of Mistaken Identity." *Journal of Musicology* 15 (1997): 43-65.
- Thompson, Douglas E. "A Summary of Current Debates Regarding Josquin's Biography and the Attribution of *Absalon, fili mi*." *Choral Journal* 42 (2001): 25-32.
- Urquhart, Peter. "Another Impolitic Observation on *Absalon, fili mi*." *Journal of Musicology* 26 (2009): 512-565.

APPENDIX:

List of *NJE* numbers for works discussed throughout *AHWM* and its related anthologies.

Title	<i>NJE</i> number
Absalon fili mi	14.1
Adieu mes amours	28.3
Ave Maria (benedicta tu)	23.4
Ave Maria (virgo serena)	23.6
De profundis	*15.11
Dominus regnavit	*17.1
Faulte d'argent	(29.7)
Mille regretz	28.25
Missa Faysant regretz	8.1
Missa Hercules dux Ferrariae	11.1
Missa L'homme arme...super voces	(6.3)
Missa Malheur me bat	9.1
Missa Pange Lingua	4.3
Mittit ad virginem	24.6
Nymphes des bois	(29.18)
Tu pauperum refugium (Secunda pars of Magnus est tu Domine)	21.6
Tu solus qui facis mirabilia*	22.5
Virgo prudentissima	25.12

Works not yet published are included in parentheses. *Opera dubia* are marked with an asterisk to reflect the starring system in *NJE* itself.

IN SEARCH OF
MEDIEVAL IRISH CHANT AND LITURGY:
A CHRONOLOGICAL OVERVIEW
OF THE
SECONDARY LITERATURE

Introduction

The study of chant, especially in the earliest periods of Christianity before the introduction of musical notation, is inextricable from the study of liturgy. Text-only liturgical manuscripts – such as Psalters, graduals, antiphoners, breviaries, and missals – give us the contents and structures of ecclesiastical and monastic services, allowing us to compare liturgical practices from across medieval Christendom and make inferences about the relationships between different regional traditions.⁵³ Even after the introduction of musical notation in the 9th or 10th century CE, chant and liturgy are best understood together, since one forms an essential part of the other. This is as true for sources for chant and liturgy in Ireland as for sources from the rest of Europe, and it can be argued that the study of Irish and Irish-derived sources not only illuminates the development and practice

⁵³ While some later antiphoners and graduals have notation, the earliest ones do not. See, for example, the comparative charts in René-Jean Hesbert, *Antiphonale Missarum sextuplex*. (Brussels: Vromant, 1935; reprinted Rome: Herder, 1967).

of Christianity in Ireland itself, but also augments our understanding of what was happening in medieval Europe at large.

As authors such as Thomas Cahill have shown, an understanding of Irish monasticism and missionary activity is crucial to understanding the preservation of Classical learning following the collapse of the Roman Empire during the fifth century CE.⁵⁴ Furthermore, Irish monastic foundations on the continent, such as St. Gall, Luxeuil, and Bobbio, are the sources of some of the most important early liturgical manuscripts with musical notation in existence.⁵⁵ While the relationship between the liturgical practices of these monasteries at their founding in the 6th and 7th centuries and the later preservation of various chants in notation during the 10th century is not clear, seeking to identify liturgical and musical practices in medieval Ireland not only illuminates the history of Christianity in the Emerald Isle, but also augments our understanding of chant practices across Europe.⁵⁶

⁵⁴ Thomas Cahill, *How the Irish Saved Civilization: The Untold Story of Ireland's Heroic Role from the Fall of Rome to the Rise of Medieval Europe* (New York: Anchor Books, 1995).

⁵⁵ Harmut Möller, "Office Compositions from St. Gall: Saints Gallus and Otmar," in *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography. In honor of Ruth Steiner*, ed. Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 237-256.

⁵⁶ Marc Scheideas, "The Origins of the Early Irish Liturgy," in *Irland und Europa im Früheren Mittelalter: Bildung und Literatur*, ed. Próinséas Ní Chatháin and Michael Richter (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 1996): 76.

One challenge facing researchers is that much of the relevant secondary scholarship about early Irish chant and liturgy is scattered among the fields of liturgical studies, Celtic studies, church history, Irish history, and musicology. Also, while the study of Irish chant repertoire and sources has its roots in the nineteenth century, it is only in the past few decades that this niche of scholarship has received a more thorough investigation.

In response to these developments, this study provides a focused, introductory overview of the secondary literature on medieval Irish chant and liturgy. Structured as a selective chronological bibliographic essay and literature review, the study spans scholarship from the nineteenth through the twenty-first centuries. Since not all sources consulted for this study are discussed in the essay, readers may wish to look at the works consulted list and the chronological bibliography in the appendix for a more complete overview of sources. This historiographical review of the secondary literature on early Irish chant and liturgy starts with the work of Frederick Warren in the late nineteenth century and ends with the publication of the monumental *New History of Ireland* in 2005. In the present context, “medieval Irish chant and liturgy” refers to the practices of the churches and monasteries in Ireland, and Irish monastic foundations in continental Europe, from the introduction of Christianity to Ireland during the fifth and sixth centuries CE through the ascendancy of Anglo-Norman power under Henry II in the twelfth century to a cut-off point of around 1300 or 1400 CE.

Frederick Warren

The foundational nineteenth-century work on early and medieval Irish liturgy and chant is Frederick Warren's *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*. Published in 1881, it is especially useful for its systematic comparisons of what was known in Warren's time of the difference between Irish and Roman liturgy, and for its lists of primary and secondary sources.⁵⁷ Warren believed in a "Celtic Rite," or liturgical characteristics shared by the churches of Celtic-speaking peoples across Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Brittany, and the Anglo-Saxon kingdoms of England before the gradual promulgation of more Roman-style rites across these regions from the seventh or eighth century C.E. forward.⁵⁸

Though his book title references this "Celtic Church," Warren was predominantly interested in sources and evidence for medieval Irish liturgy. As an ordained Anglican priest,⁵⁹ his search for an ancient insular liturgy

⁵⁷ Warren, Frederick Edward. *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1881.

⁵⁸ One important milestone in this centuries-long process was the Synod of Whitby held in Scotland from 664-666 C.E. that attempted to resolve clashes between the Roman and Celtic churches over methods of dating Easter and cutting tonsures, as well as the issues of clerical marriage and mixed monasteries. Other influences may have been the power-consolidating reforms in Gaul and the Holy Roman Empire in the ninth century by the Carolingian rulers Pepin the Short and Charlemagne.

⁵⁹ Jane Stevenson, introduction to Frederick Edward Warren, *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*, 2nd ed., ed. Jane Stevenson (Woodbridge, England: Boydell Press, 1987): ix.

separated from the power of Rome may have come from personal, professional, and political motivations.⁶⁰

A second edition of Warren's work was published in 1987. Edited by Jane Stevenson, it includes a long and informative introductory essay by Stevenson incorporating more recent scholarship, as well as some additional indexes and an updated bibliography. Stevenson's commentary, annotations, and emendations to the text help the reader navigate Warren's Victorian prose and polemical views. However, Irish musicologist Ann Buckley has pointed out that Stevenson did not catch all of Warren's errors,⁶¹ so even the second edition of *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church* must be read with a critical eye.

Early Twentieth-Century Scholars

In addition to Warren's book, the work of a few early twentieth century scholars is worth noting. In 1910, Dom Louis Gouard's essay "Celtiques (Liturgies)" was published in the *Dictionnaire d'archéologie et de Liturgies*

⁶⁰ Henry Chadwick, foreword to Warren, *Liturgy*, vii.

⁶¹ "Music in Ireland to c. 1500," 804. The specific problem in question concerns the possible existence (and destruction) of pipe organs in early Christian Ireland. Buckley believes that the term "organ" does not refer to pipe organs, but to instruments in general; thus, thinking that pipe organs existed in early Irish churches and monasteries comes from a misreading of the original sources.

Chretiennes, and 1932 he expanded his observations into a book, *Christianity in Celtic Lands*.⁶²

Henry Jenner, in his 1913 article on the “Celtic Rite” in the *Catholic Encyclopedia*, expressed the view – in counterpoint to Warren – that the Celtic Rite had never been completely separate from Rome, and that it was not uniform – a feature that was not so unusual, since it existed during a time when liturgies all over Europe were not uniform.⁶³ If anything, the liturgy (and, by inference, chants) in medieval Ireland were influenced by the traditions in Gaul, Spain, Rome, Milan, Egypt, Jerusalem, Britain, and elsewhere, and in turn affected the liturgies celebrated in the Irish foundations on the European continent throughout Gaul, Italy, and the Germanic lands.

While now somewhat dated, James F. Kenney’s exhaustive two-volume *The Sources for the Early History of Ireland: An Introduction and Guide* from 1929 is still an invaluable portal to primary sources and earlier secondary literature. The first volume, on ecclesiastical sources, is especially pertinent for the study of medieval Irish liturgy and chant. The work is structured around topics such as “Ireland in the Ancient World,” “The Irish Church in

⁶² Louis Gougaud, “Celtiques (Liturgies),” in *Dictionnaire D’archéologie ed de Liturgies Chretiennes*, vol 2, pt 2, ed. Fernarnd Cabrol, Henri Leclercq, and Henri Marrou (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1910): 2969-3032; idem, *Christianity in Celtic Lands* (London: Sheed and Ward, 1932).

⁶³ Henry Jenner, “Celtic Rite,” in *The Catholic Encyclopedia*, vol 3, ed. Charles G. Herbermann et al. (New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1913): 493-504.

the ‘Celtic’ Period,” and “The Monastic Churches, Their Founders and Traditions.” Each of the eight sections comprises a thorough, introductory essay to each topic and a well-annotated bibliography.⁶⁴

Kathleen Hughes

Of the later twentieth-century scholars to challenge the idea a pan-regional Celtic rite, perhaps none was more influential than Kathleen Hughes. In 1966, she published her seminal overview of the early Irish Church, *The Church in Early Irish Society*, and in 1972 provided a key guide for medieval Irish liturgical studies called *Early Christian Ireland: Introduction to the Sources*. These works are important for their interdisciplinary approach, and for their innovative views of early and medieval Irish history. As Dáibhí Ó Crónín has noted,

Scholarly activity in the years since [her death in] 1977 has been profoundly influenced by her teaching and writing. Her first book ... “liberated” the subject from earlier stereotypes and helped to set it on a new course, while her own use of source materials and her [second book] pointed the way to further advances.⁶⁵

⁶⁴ James F. Kenney, *The Sources for the Early History of Ireland: An Introduction and Guide*. 2 vols. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1929).

⁶⁵ Prefatory footnote to a posthumously published article by Kathleen Hughes, “The Church in Irish Society, 400-800,” in *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*, vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*, ed. Dáibhí Ó Crónín (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 301.

In addition to the monographs mentioned above, Hughes published numerous articles. One of the most important of these is “The Celtic Church: Is This A Valid Concept?” first delivered as a lecture and then published posthumously in 1981 in the inaugural issue of *Cambridge Medieval Celtic Studies*. This article compared Irish ecclesiastical and monastic administrative structures with those in Gaul, and questioned whether or not one can speak of a unified Irish or “Celtic Church” in Ireland before the Normans came into power in the twelfth century.

Frank Ll. Harrison

In 1967, a year after Hughes published *The Church in Early Irish Society*, Oxford music history professor Frank Llewellyn Harrison published an article called “Polyphony in Medieval Ireland” in a Festschrift honoring noted medieval musicologist Bruno Stäblein.⁶⁶ Harrison was astonished that

The liturgy of the Celtic church, despite the length of its existence and the spread of its influence, has as yet no ascertained musical history. The evidence that it was a sung liturgy comes, for example, from the Venerable Bede ... writing in the seventh century about the church of Lindisfarne [...]. Among the liturgical rubrics which prescribe singing are ... the *Gospel Book of Dimma* (middle of the seventh century) ... the *Book of Mulling* (late seventh century), and ... the *Stowe Missal* of the

⁶⁶ Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht, “Bruno Stäblein,” in *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*, ed. Laura Macey, <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/26496> (accessed May 6, 2012).

ninth-tenth century. Nevertheless, the surviving liturgical books and fragments of the Celtic church contain no musical notation, nor have any chants in later manuscripts been plausibly ascribed as yet to a Celtic source. As far as is at present known the music of the Celtic rite has sunk without leaving any trace.⁶⁷

Earlier in the article, Harrison had categorized the “Celtic rite” and the “Celtic Church” as the Christian institutions that existed in Ireland before “St. Malachy, Archbishop of Armagh from 1134 to 1148, imposed on his church a liturgy approved by Pope Innocent II.” Harrison also believed that “following the conquest of Ireland by the Norman English king Henry II in 1172, the Irish church was ordered to use the English liturgy known as the Use of Sarum.”⁶⁸ The implication of these conclusions was that post-Sarum notated sources from Ireland held little of value for understanding pre-Sarum liturgy and chant in Ireland. Harrison’s article draws heavily on the older work of Warren, and does not seem to question the construction of a monocultural “Celtic” identity, nor does he seem bothered by the interchangeable use of the terms Celtic and Irish. Although the article is very short, Harrison’s impression that the music of the early medieval Irish church was irretrievably lost is quoted (and subsequently challenged) over and over again in literature on Irish chant. Nevertheless, this essay is valuable for having sparked interest and further research in the admittedly obscure topic of chant and liturgy in medieval Ireland.

⁶⁷ Frank Ll. Harrison, “Polyphony in Medieval Ireland,” in *Festschrift Bruno Stäblein zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. Martin Ruhnke (Kassel: Barenreiter-Verlag, 1967): 74-75.

⁶⁸ Harrison, “Polyphony,” 74.

Bruno Stäblein

Ironically, it was the honoree of Harrison's essay, Bruno Stäblein, who finally made some progress in suggesting that at least some music of the "Celtic Rite" might be recoverable. In 1973, Stäblein published the groundbreaking article "Zwei Melodien der altirischen Liturgie."⁶⁹ In it he proposed that two chant melodies, *Ibunt Sancti* and *Crucem sanctam subiit*, had unusual phrase structures and might be of Celtic or Irish origin. Part of the evidence for this is that *Ibunt Sancti* was sung by a seventh-century monk on his deathbed in the Irish foundation of Bobbio, and that in the *Navigatio Sancti Brendani* there is an account of St. Brendan and his companions finding an island during their legendary sea voyage where *Ibunt Sancti* was sung all day long.⁷⁰

Aloys Fleishmann

When the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* was published in 1980, it contained an entry by Aloys Fleishmann on music of the Celtic rite.⁷¹ It is useful for its discussion of Irish history, its examination of

⁶⁹ Bruno Stäblein, "Zwei Melodien der Altirischen Liturgie," in *Musicae Scientiae Collectanea: Festschrift Karl Gustav Fellerer zum sechzigsten Geburtstag*, ed. Heinrich Hüschen (Cologne: Arno-Volk-Verlag, 1973): 590-603.

⁷⁰ Ann Buckley, "Music in Ireland to c. 1500," in *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*, vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*, ed. Dáibhí Ó Crónín (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 794-796.

⁷¹ Aloys Fleishmann, "Celtic Rite, Music of the," In *The New Grove Dictionary*, ed. Stanley Sadie, London: Macmillan, 1980.

the prevalent use of hymns in Irish liturgy (a practice that has some correlation in the Gallican rite), and its incorporation of Bruno Stäblein's new ideas and methodology for trying to recover specimens of Irish chant.⁷² It is also useful for its bibliography containing older materials, some of which are not included in the second edition of *New Grove*. Fleischmann, a German immigrant to Ireland,⁷³ had previously contributed to the broadening of knowledge on Irish chant with articles such as “Die Iren in der Neumen – und Chorforschung” in 1934 and “Music in Ancient Munster and Monastic Cork” in 1965.

Kenneth Levy

In 1990, a new, second edition of the *New Oxford History of Music* volume on the early middle ages up to the end of the thirteenth century was published. Completely reorganized and rewritten from previous editions, it reflected new information and changing attitudes in chant and medieval

⁷² The Gallican rite refers to the loosely connected corpus of liturgical traditions in Gaul (now France) before the imposition of the Franco-Roman, “Gregorian” liturgy in the 8th and 9th centuries by Pepin the Short and his son Charlemagne. This imposition, along with the absence of reliable musical notation until the 10th century, obscures older liturgical traditions. In a sense, we can only see “through a glass, darkly,” the musical activities of Christians before the invention of neumatic notation. (1 Corinthians 13, KJV). Thus, chant scholarship investigating pre-Carolingian chant and liturgy is much more difficult than post-Carolingian scholarship, and must focus more on liturgical structures than on melodic possibilities. However, as discussed above, there do seem to be some echoes of these earlier traditions even in later manuscripts.

⁷³ Séamas de Barra, “Aloys Fleischmann (1910 -1992): A Major Figure in Twentieth-century Irish Music,” *British Music Society News* 126 (2010): 282-289.

scholarship towards literacy and orality precipitated by scholars such as Leo Treitler.⁷⁴ One of the new entries was “Latin Chant Outside the Roman Tradition” by Kenneth Levy.⁷⁵ This article discusses characteristics of chant in general, gives brief overview of early liturgical texts for “Celtic chant,” and puzzles over the dearth of sources, despite the vigorous missionary activity of Irish monks. Two years later, Levy participated in a roundtable discussion of non-Roman chants at the 1992 International Musicological Society meeting in Madrid, Spain. His conference paper abstract, “The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant,” is useful for its acknowledgement of the importance of looking beyond Rome for the development of chant, and for de-centering the evolution of Roman chants as the most important narrative.⁷⁶

⁷⁴ Notable examples of Trietler’s work include “Homer and Gregory: The Transmission of Epic Poetry and Plainchant,” *Musical Quarterly* 60 (1974): 333-372; “Centonate” Chant: “Übles Flickwerk” or “E pluribus unus?” *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 28 (1975): 1-23; and the collection of essays *With Voice and Pen: Coming to Know Medieval Song and How It Was Made*, rev. ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).

⁷⁵ Kenneth Levy, “Latin Chant Outside the Roman Tradition,” in *The Early Middle Ages to 1300*, vol. 2 of *The New Oxford History of Music*, 2nd ed., ed. Richard Crocker and David Hiley (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990): 69-90.

⁷⁶ Kenneth Levy, “Round Table VI: The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant,” *Acta Musicologica* 63 (1991): 23-24; and Kenneth Levy, “Round Table VI: The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant,” in *Revista de Musicología* 16, *Del XV Congreso de la Sociedad Internacional de Musicología: Culturas Musicales Del Mediterráneo y sus Ramificaciones* (1993): 435-437.

Patrick Brannon

A significant contribution to understanding later medieval Irish chant practice is Patrick Brannon's 1990 doctoral dissertation, "A Contextual Study of the Four Notated Sarum Divine Office Manuscripts from Anglo-Norman Ireland."⁷⁷ This work challenged Harrison's assumptions that the Celtic rite had "sunk without a trace," and also established the legitimacy of studying notated Irish manuscripts from after the Norman invasion and imposition of the Sarum rite. (This is in contrast to Fleischmann's view, expressed in his 1980 *New Grove* article, that Irish Sarum use could largely be ignored when searching for the early medieval "Celtic rite"). Following the publication of his dissertation, Brannon also presented his views on the connections and relationships between fifteenth century Irish and British uses of the Sarum rite in the article "The Search for the Celtic Rite," published in 1993. While focused on later medieval sources, there is a good presentation of the overall history of music and liturgy in the medieval Irish church⁷⁸

Ann Buckley

Along with Brannon, Ann Buckley emerged as the most prolific scholar of Celtic chant in the 1990s. Her command of a wide array of literature is

⁷⁷ Patrick V. Brannon, "A Contextual Study of the Four Notated Sarum Divine Office Manuscripts from Anglo-Norman Ireland" (PhD diss., Washington University, 1990).

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, 14-16.

impressive, as is her work in musical archeology, organology, and iconography. In a monumental 1995 article called “And His Voice Swelled Like a Terrible Thunderstorm....’: music as Symbolic Sound in Medieval Irish Society,” Buckley discusses documentary and archeological evidence for music and musicians in ancient Irish society, as well as the search for the Celtic rite.⁷⁹ She argues against marginalizing material from the “Celtic fringe” of Ireland, Scotland, Wales, and Brittany, and challenges scholarly attitudes that view Irish chant source materials as having nothing to contribute to a wider understanding of chant development and practices throughout medieval Europe. She warns against the tendency of not understanding Irish sources in the context of other continental European sources, either viewing these materials as isolated examples on the fringes of liturgical practice or succumbing to what she calls a “magic bag syndrome” whereby things that are odd or mystical are stuffed under the label “Celtic,” regardless of their true origins.⁸⁰

Early Music on Irish Music: The Special 2001 Issue

In 1998, Buckley and Brannon organized a presentation session on Irish music at the annual International Congress for Medieval Studies held

⁷⁹ Buckley, “And his voice swelled like a terrible thunderstorm... : Music as Symbolic Sound in Medieval Irish Society.” In *Music and Irish Cultural History*, Irish Musical Studies, 3, ed. Gerard Gillen and Harry White (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1995): 13-76.

⁸⁰ Ibid., 20-23.

at the University of Western Michigan in Kalamazoo, MI.⁸¹ The results of these conference presentations were compiled and published in 2000 in a special issue of *Early Music* devoted entirely to medieval Irish music. The issue featured articles by Buckley and Brannon, as well as Martin Czernin, Sara Gibbs Casey, Theodore Karp, Barra Boydell, Paul Nixon, and the early music group Altramar.

In Buckley's opening *Early Music* editorial, she pointed out that studying Celtic material is important for our understanding of medieval music as a whole, even though "Irish medieval notated sources are few, and late in date, compared with most of western Europe – though the quantity is considerably greater than for either Scotland or Wales."⁸² She called for more detailed medieval scholarship throughout Ireland, Scotland, and Wales, and for systematic examination of known medieval manuscripts for clues to their chant repertoires. While she acknowledged the contributions of Fleischmann, Stäblein, and Harrison to the field of Irish chant studies, she also pointed out the problems with their views. Buckley stated that the goal of scholarship in this area should not only be to search for distinctive features of Irish chant, but also to thoroughly take stock of the sources that currently exist, examining them and indexing their contents without dismissing any of them

⁸¹ See Buckley, "Research Project: Music in Medieval Ireland," email to H-mustxt mailing list, April 28, 1998. <http://h-net.msu.edu/cgi-bin/logbrowse.pl?trx=vx&list=h-mustxt&month=9804&week=d&msg=ZqMNyZXAImpHHzAqnI8RA&user=&pw=> (accessed April 19, 2012).

⁸² Buckley, "Editorial," *Early Music* 28 (2000): 164.

offhand.⁸³ Thus the aim of the special issue was to explore and demonstrate the scope and relevance of medieval Irish music, not only for the history of music in Ireland, but also for the history of music in the rest of Western Europe.

Buckley's main article for the special issue, "Music and Musicians in Medieval Irish Society," discusses iconographic, archaeological and documentary evidence for the role of music and musicians in ancient and early medieval Ireland. It includes a discussion of liturgical sources, and gives plausible inferences about musical practice in medieval Ireland from those manuscript sources. In the article, Buckley announced her intention to compile a reference work of *Liturgical Sources for the Veneration of Irish Saints* in collaboration with Sara Gibbs Casey, but as of 2013 this work has yet to be published.

Brannon's article, "Medieval Ireland: Music in Cathedral, Church and Cloister,"⁸⁴ provides a nicely laid out, brief overview of the primary sources for Irish chant, such as the Stowe Missal, the Antiphony of Bangor, and the Irish Liber Hymnorum. He states: "these sources reveal that the Celtic Rite was essentially Roman in both structure and contents, yet contained Gallican characteristics such as the liturgical use of hymns."⁸⁵ Then, as in his

⁸³ Ibid., 165.

⁸⁴ Brannon, "Medieval Ireland: Music in Cathedral, Church and Cloister," *Early Music* 28 (2000): 193-202.

⁸⁵ Ibid., 194.

dissertation and previous articles, Brannon discusses the relationship of Irish chant to Sarum use, and the Sarum-style sources, such as the Lambeth Palace Missal. He analyzes two chants – *Ecce fulget* and *Ductu angelico* – for correlations to Sarum use, and discusses known extant Irish manuscripts that have musical notation.

One of the most interesting articles in the issue is “Through a Glass, Darkly: Steps Towards Reconstructing Irish chant from the Neumes of the Drummond Missal” by Sara Gibbs Casey.⁸⁶ This is an important report on deciphering the earliest known examples of musical notation in an Irish source, a source that had previously been dismissed as indecipherable because of the nature of the un-heightened neumes in the Missal. Casey demonstrates ingenuity and persistence in her analyses, and while her findings are not conclusive, they are the closest anyone has come to being able to read the Drummond neumes.

Martin Czernin’s contribution to the special issue, “Fragments of Liturgical Chant from Medieval Irish Monasteries in Continental Europe” is valuable for its discussion of manuscript fragments in the Irish-founded Schottenstift library in Vienna.⁸⁷ These manuscripts preserve traces of a unique Irish-derived liturgy at an all-Irish monastery in Vienna from the

⁸⁶ Sara Gibbs Casey, “Through a Glass Darkly: Steps Towards Reconstructing Irish Chant from the Neumes of the Drummond Missal,” *Early Music* 28 (2000): 205-215.

⁸⁷ Martin Czernin, “Fragments of Liturgical Chant from Medieval Irish Monasteries in Continental Europe,” *Early Music* 28 (2000): 217-224.

twelfth through the fifteenth centuries CE. Since there are few, if any, correlates in manuscript sources from Ireland from this time period, the Schottenstift fragments offer a rare glimpse of what Irish chant and liturgical practice may have looked like in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. The fragments also help show the extent of the Irish foundations on the continent: by whom they were founded, who they venerated as their patron saints, and of their continued administrative ties to mother-houses in Ireland.

As with most periodicals, the next issue of *Early Music* contained correspondence about the previous issue's articles. Peter Downey wrote in, complaining that Frank Ll. Harrison's work had not received enough attention. In a terse and witty reply, Buckley countered that Harrison had, in fact, been cited by several of the contributors. She emphasized that the Irish issue had been the product of an interdisciplinary, teamwork approach. Criticizing Downey's own scholarly methods as old-fashioned and his penchant for not including dissenting opinions in his publications, Buckley rejoiced that

Gone, at last, are the days when it was acceptable to write from a lonely perch, "all alone," even in the often contentious field of what some still call "Irish music." In the absence of cumulative and revisable knowledge, it is impossible to any body of scholarship to reach maturity, and thus meet internationally acceptable standards of intellectual rigour and accountability.⁸⁸

⁸⁸ Buckley, "Correspondence: Early Music of Ireland," In response to Peter Downey, *Early Music* 28 (2000): 510.

This stance shows a willingness to tap the power of collaboration, particularly in a highly specialized field such as chant. When one considers Theodore Karp's remark that it is impossible for one person to have an encyclopedic knowledge of all the sources, a collaborative approach such as Buckley suggests towards research in the admittedly arcane area of Irish chant and liturgy makes a lot of sense.⁸⁹

Peter Jeffery

In addition to the special issue of *Early Music* on Irish music, 2000 also saw the publication of Peter Jeffery's chapter "Eastern and Western Elements in the Irish Monastic Prayer of the Hours" in *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography*.⁹⁰ This article is valuable for Jeffery's willingness to look beyond musical sources to sacred and secular medieval Irish literature for information on Irish chant and liturgical practices, and to compare what these sources with continental European sources. It contains a fine critique of Warren's book, and examines and compares different early practices of the

⁸⁹ Theodore Karp, "A Serendipitous Encounter with St. Kilian," *Early Music* 28 (2000): 227.

⁹⁰ Peter Jeffery, "Eastern and Western Elements in the Irish Monastic Prayer of the Hours," in *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography. In honor of Ruth Steiner*, ed. Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 99-143.

office hours and psalm singing. Jeffery suggests that in medieval Ireland the entire Psalter was chanted in a single day, divided into thirds and known as the “three fifties.” This devotional exercise may have been derived from ascetic practices in Jerusalem and Egypt, and thus helps demonstrate the contact Irish monks had with the wider Christian world.

New Grove, Second Edition

In 2001, the second edition of *The New Grove Dictionary Of Music and Musicians* replaced Fleischmann’s 1980 article on the “Celtic Rite” with one by Buckley on “Celtic Chant.” This new article provides a much more thorough overview of the historical background and liturgical structure of Irish chant. It discusses the practice of the divine office in Ireland, psalmody, the non-standard pre-Carolingian mass, the unusually prevalent liturgical and devotional use of hymns, and gives an inventory of notated sources. Buckley states that the small amount of evidence we do have for Irish chant challenges the idea that the Celtic Rite is irretrievable.

Other Work

Published a few years after her *Early Music* article on deciphering the Drummond neumes, Sara Gibbs Casey’s 2003 doctoral dissertation on the music of the Irish *perigrini*, or wandering monks, is important for enlarging our understanding of Irish foundations on the European continent, and for

grasping the scope of the veneration of Irish saints outside of Ireland, thus establishing possible lines of influence and spiritual inheritance.⁹¹ It is also instructive for demonstrating just how mobile people were in the Middle Ages, and how religious fervor could be enough impetus for traveling long distances on foot and horseback.

In 2005, the long awaited (and monumental) *New History of Ireland* finally appeared. The first volume, *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*, is of particular interest to scholars of medieval Irish liturgy and chant since it contains two (posthumous) articles by Kathleen Hughes on the history of the Irish church and one by Ann Buckley on music in prehistoric and early Christian Ireland.

The first article by Hughes, “The Church in Irish Society, 400-800,” covers the coming of Christianity to Ireland in the fifth century through Roman influence and the missionary activity of Palladius and Patrick.⁹² She also discusses issues such as church organization, the rise of monasticism, evangelism, pilgrimage, and the evidence from the Irish Annals for the growth of Christianity in Ireland. The second article, “The Irish Church, 800-c.1050,” continues along similar lines, examining the impact of growth and

⁹¹ Casey, “Songs for the *Peregrini*: Proper Chants for Irish Saints as Found in Continental Manuscripts of the Middle Ages” (PhD diss., University of Pittsburgh, 2003).

⁹² Kathleen Hughes, “The Church in Irish Society, 400-800,” in *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*, vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*, ed. Dáibhí Ó Crónín (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 301-330.

organizational stabilization on the Irish church, as well as the consequences of Viking raids on monasteries and urban centers.⁹³

Ann Buckley's "Music in Ireland to c. 1500" is a wide-ranging and detailed article covering everything from prehistoric archeological finds to sixteenth century English polemics against Irish musicians. The scholar of Irish chant and liturgy will find the section of this article from pages 776-808 the most useful. Here Buckley covers the origins of the term "Celtic Rite," and discusses notated and un-notated original sources that give clues to the structure and function of liturgy and chant in early Christian Ireland.⁹⁴

Conclusions

Overall, serious scholarship on Irish chant and liturgy seems to be based on source studies, and on efforts to improve the number and type of sources examined for evidence of liturgy and chant in medieval Ireland and Irish monastic foundations on the European continent. In the case of Ann Buckley, this extends to archaeological evidence for music in ancient and medieval Ireland. Scholars who pursue an understanding of Irish chant and liturgical studies are quick to point out the value of their studies for a wider

⁹³ Kathleen Hughes, "The Irish Church, 800–c. 1050," in *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*, vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*, ed. Dáibhí Ó Crónín (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 635-655.

⁹⁴ Ann Buckley, "Music in Ireland to c. 1500," in *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*, vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*, ed. Dáibhí Ó Crónín (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 744-813.

understanding of the development of Christian chant and liturgy throughout medieval Europe, and of how diverse traditions influenced each other. This type of scholarship is a welcome balance to a type of mystical, spiritual literature that embraces “Celtic Christianity” or “Celtic Spirituality” as being more ecologically friendly, more equal in its treatment of women, and of being more truly rooted in ancient Christian (or pagan) traditions.⁹⁵

Areas for Further Research

There is still much work to be done in researching medieval Irish chant and liturgy. In 2000, Buckley lamented that “a clear idea of the full contents of Irish liturgical manuscripts in continental European holdings” was still lacking despite the contributions of Warren, Harrison, Stäblein, and others.⁹⁶ Similarly, Brannon stated that “the entire corpus of Irish manuscripts [had] not yet been systematically examined for references to music.”⁹⁷ Thus, there is a need for a thorough study of the medieval manuscripts in Irish holdings. Scholars also need to consider the manuscripts in English, Scottish, Welsh, and continental European collections that have

⁹⁵ For an overview of this type of literature and the thinking behind it, see Loren Wilkinson, “Saving Celtic Christianity: Despite the Mythmaking, There’s a Wealth of Christian Truth and Devotion Worth Recovering,” *Christianity Today* April 24 (2000): 78-85.

⁹⁶ Buckley, “Music and Musicians,” 165.

⁹⁷ Brannon, “Medieval Ireland: Music in Cathedral, Church and Cloister,” 195.

traces of originating from Ireland or contain Irish material in order to fill out our understanding of medieval chant and liturgy at large.

Since the current study only discusses secondary sources from 1881 to 2005, the historiography of the field could also be extended and expanded to include both older and more recent sources. In the near future, I plan on exploring the possibility of creating an online bibliographic database dedicated to the liturgy, chant, and ecclesiastical and monastic history of medieval Ireland. The database could be divided into topical sections, such as archeology, architecture, monasticism, general historical sources, manuscript studies, chant, or liturgy. It would also contain sections on primary materials, in addition to covering secondary sources, as has been done here. The advantages of an online resource such as this, instead of a more traditional hardbound research companion, include worldwide access via Internet, keyword searching, the possibility of reducing the time-lag between a scholarly publication and its inclusion in the bibliographic database, and continuous updating. Possible partners for such an ambitious project include the Keough-Naughton Institute for Irish Studies at Notre Dame in Notre Dame, IN or the Medieval Institute at Western Michigan University in Kalamazoo, MI, as well as my current employing institution, the James White Library at Andrews University in Berrien Springs, MI.

Works Consulted

- Barra, Séamas de. "Aloys Fleischmann (1910 -1992): A Major Figure in Twentieth-century Irish Music." *British Music Society News* 126 (2010): 282-289.
- Boydell, Barra. "Evidence for Music in the Medieval Irish Liturgy: A Survey." In *Anáil Dé: The Breath of God: Music, Ritual and Spirituality*. Edited by Helen Phelan. (Dublin: Veritas Publications for Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick, 2001): 71-80.
- Brannon, Patrick V. "A Contextual Study of the Four Notated Sarum Divine Office Manuscripts from Anglo-Norman Ireland." PhD diss., Washington University, 1990.
In ProQuest Dissertations and Theses
<http://search.proquest.com.ezproxy.lib.uwm.edu/pqdtft/docview/303904079/abstract/136950B8C004D223DA0/2?accountid=15078> (Accessed April 23, 2012).
- _____. "The Search for the Celtic Rite: The [Trinity College Dublin] Sarum Divine Office Mss Reassessed." In *Music and the Church*. Irish Musical Studies, 2, edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1993): 13-40.
- _____. "Medieval Ireland: Music in Cathedral, Church and Cloister." *Early Music* 28 (2000): 193-202.
- Buckley, Ann. "And his voice swelled like a terrible thunderstorm... : Music as Symbolic Sound in Medieval Irish Society." In *Music and Irish Cultural History*. Irish Musical Studies, 3, edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1995): 13-76.
- _____. "Research Project: Music in Medieval Ireland." Email to H-mustxt mailing list, April 28, 1998.
<http://h-net.msu.edu/cgi-bin/logbrowse.pl?trx=vx&list=h-mustxt&month=9804&week=d&msg=ZqMNyZXAIImPhHpzAqnI8RA&user=&pw=> (Accessed April 19, 2012).
- _____. "Editorial." *Early Music* 28 (2000): 164.
- _____. "Music and Musicians in Medieval Irish Society." *Early Music* 28 (2000): 165-190.

- _____. "Correspondence: Early Music of Ireland." In response to Peter Downey. *Early Music* 28 (2000): 510.
- _____. "Celtic Chant." In *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*. <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/article/grove/music/05266> (Accessed March 15, 2012).
- _____. "Music in Ireland to c. 1500." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 744-813.
- Cahill, Thomas. *How the Irish Saved Civilization: The Untold Story of Ireland's Heroic Role from the Fall of Rome to the Rise of Medieval Europe*. New York: Anchor Books, 1995.
- Casey, Sara Gibbs. "Through a Glass Darkly: Steps Towards Reconstructing Irish Chant from the Neumes of the Drummond Missal." *Early Music* 28 (2000): 205-215.
- _____. "Songs for the *Peregrini*: Proper Chants for Irish Saints as Found in Continental Manuscripts of the Middle Ages." PhD diss., University of Pittsburgh, 2003.
- Corning, Caitlin. *The Celtic and Roman Traditions: Conflict and Consensus in the Early Medieval Church*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006.
- Czernin, Martin. "Fragments of Liturgical Chant from Medieval Irish Monasteries in Continental Europe." *Early Music* 28 (2000): 217-224.
- Eggebrecht, Hans Heinrich. "Bruno Stäblein." In *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*. <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/2646> (Accessed May 6, 2012).
- Ellis, Peter Berresford. *A Brief History of the Celts*. 2nd. ed. London: Constable & Robinson, 2003.
- Fleischmann, Aloys. "Die Iren in der Neumen – und Choralforschung." *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 16 (1934): 352-355.
- _____. "Music in Ancient Munster and Monastic Cork" *Journal of the Cork Historical and Archaeological Society* 70 (1965): 79-98.

- _____. "Celtic Rite, Music of the." *The New Grove Dictionary*. ed. Stanley Sadie. (London: Macmillan, 1980): 52-54.
- Gougoud, Louis. "Celtiques (Liturgies)." In *Dictionnaire d'archéologie et de Liturgies Chretiennes*. Vol 2, pt. 2. Edited by Fernand Cabrol, Henri Leclercq, and Henri Marrou. (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1910): 2969-3032.
- _____. *Christianity in Celtic Lands*. London: Sheed and Ward, 1932.
- Gushee, Marion S. "The Polyphonic Music of the Medieval Monastery, Cathedral, and University." In *Antiquity and the Middle Ages: From Ancient Greece to the 15th century*. Music and Society. Edited by James McKinnon. (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1991): 143-151.
- Hesbert, René-Jean. *Antiphonale Missarum sextuplex*. Brussels: Vromant, 1935; reprinted, Rome: Herder, 1967.
- Harrison, Frank Ll. "Polyphony in Medieval Ireland." In *Festschrift Bruno Stäblein zum 70. Geburtstag*. Edited by Martin Ruhnke. (Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 1967): 74-78.
- Hughes, Kathleen. *The Church in Early Irish Society*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1966.
- _____. *Early Christian Ireland: Introduction to the Sources*. The Sources of History: Studies in the Uses of Historical Evidence. London: Camelot Press, 1972.
- _____. "The Celtic Church: Is this a Valid Concept?" *Cambridge Medieval Celtic Studies* 1 (1981): 1-20.
- _____. "The Church in Irish Society, 400-800." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 301-330.
- _____. "The Irish Church, 800-c.1050." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 635-655.

- Jeffery, Peter. "Eastern and Western Elements in the Irish Monastic Prayer of the Hours." In *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography. In honor of Ruth Steiner*. Edited by Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 99-143.
- Jenner, Henry. "Celtic Rite." In *The Catholic Encyclopedia*. Vol 3. Edited by Charles G. Herbermann et al. (New York: The Encyclopedia Press, 1913): 493-504.
- Karp, Theodore. "A Serendipitous Encounter with St. Kilian." *Early Music* 28 (2000): 227-237.
- Kenney, James F. *The Sources for the Early History of Ireland: An Introduction and Guide*. 2 vols. New York: Columbia University Press, 1929.
- Lawrence, Frank. "What Did They Sing at Cashel in 1172?: Winchester, Sarum, and Romano-Frankish Chant in Ireland." *Journal of the Society for Musicology in Ireland* 3 (2007-8): 111-125.
<http://www.music.ucc.ie/jsmi/index.php/jsmi/article/viewArticle/24>
- Levy, Kenneth. "Latin Chant Outside the Roman Tradition." In *The New Oxford History of Music*, 2nd ed. Vol. 2 of *The Early Middle Ages to 1300*. Edited by Richard Crocker and David Hiley. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990): 69-90.
- _____. "Round Table VI: The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant." *Acta Musicologica* 63 (1991): 23-24.
- _____. "Round Table VI: The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant." In *Revista de Musicología* 16, *Del XV Congreso de la Sociedad Internacional de Musicología: Culturas Musicales Del Mediterráneo y sus Ramificaciones* (1993): 435-437.
- Möller, Hartmut. "Office Compositions from St. Gall: Saints Gallus and Otmar." In *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography. In honor of Ruth Steiner*. Edited by Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 237-256.

- Ní Riain, Nóirín. "The Nature and Classification of Traditional Religious Songs in Irish: with a Survey of Printed and Oral Sources." In *Music and the Church*. Irish Musical Studies, 2. Edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1993): 190-253.
- Ó Crónín, Dáibhí. "Hiberno-Latin Literature to 1169." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 371-404.
- O'Donoghue, Patrick. "Music and Religion in Ireland." In *Music and Irish Cultural History*. Irish Musical Studies, 3, edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1995): 116-152.
- Ó Fiaich, Tomás. *Columbanus in His Own Words*. Dublin: Veritas, 1974.
- Pfaff, Richard W. *Medieval Latin Liturgy: A Select Bibliography*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982.
- Scheideas, Marc. "The Origins of the Early Irish Liturgy." In *Irland und Europa im Früheren Mittelalter: Bildung und Literatur*. Edited by Próinséas Ní Chatháin and Michael Richter. (Stuttgart : Klett-Cotta, 1996): 76-97.
- Stäblein, Bruno. "Zwei Melodien der Altirischen Liturgie." In *Musicae Scientiae Collectanea: Festschrift Karl Gustav Fellerer zum Sechzigsten Geburtstag*. Edited by Heinrich Hüschen. (Cologne: Arno-Volk-Verlag, 1973): 590-603.
- Treitler, Leo. "Homer and Gregory: The Transmission of Epic Poetry and Plainchant," *Musical Quarterly* 60 (1974): 333-372.
- _____. "Centonate" Chant: "Übles Flickwerk" or "E pluribus unus?" *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 28 (1975):1-23.
- _____. *With Voice and Pen: Coming to Know Medieval Song and How It Was Made*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Walsh, John R. *A History of the Irish Church: 400-700 AD*. Dublin: Columba Press, 1991.
- Warren, Frederick Edward. *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1881.

_____. *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*. 2nd ed. Edited by Jane Stevenson. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1987.

Wilkinson, Loren "Saving Celtic Christianity: Despite the Mythmaking, There's a Wealth of Christian Truth and Devotion Worth Recovering." *Christianity Today* April 24 (2000): 78-85.



**Appendix:
Selected Chronological Bibliography**

- 1881 Warren, Frederick Edward. *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- 1910 Gougaud, Louis. "Celtiques (Liturgies)." In *Dictionnaire d'archéologie et de Liturgies Chretiennes*. Vol 2, pt. 2. Edited by Fernand Cabrol, Henri Leclercq, and Henri Marrou. (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1910): 2969-3032.
- 1913 Jenner, Henry. "Celtic Rite." In *The Catholic Encyclopedia*. Vol 3. Edited by Charles G. Herbermann et al. (New York: The Encyclopedia Press): 493-504.
- 1929 Kenney, James F. *The Sources for the Early History of Ireland: An Introduction and Guide*. 2 vols. New York: Columbia University Press.
- 1932 Gougaud, Louis. "Celtiques (Liturgies)." In *Dictionnaire d'archéologie et de Liturgies Chretiennes*. Vol 2, pt. 2. Edited by Fernand Cabrol, Henri Leclercq, and Henri Marrou. (Paris: Letouzey et Ané, 1910): 2969-3032.
- 1934 Fleischmann, Aloys. "Die Iren in der Neumen – und Choralforschung." *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* 16: 352-355.
- 1935 Hesbert, René-Jean. *Antiphonale Missarum sextuplex*. Brussels: Vromant; reprinted, Rome: Herder, 1967.
- 1965 Fleischmann, Aloys. "Music in Ancient Munster and Monastic Cork" *Journal of the Cork Historical and Archaeological Society* 70: 79-98.
- 1966 Hughes, Kathleen. *The Church in Early Irish Society*. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1966.
- 1967 Harrison, Frank Ll. "Polyphony in Medieval Ireland." In *Festschrift Bruno Stäblein zum 70. Geburtstag*. Edited by Martin Ruhnke. (Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag): 74-78.
- 1972 Hughes, Kathleen. *Early Christian Ireland: Introduction to the Sources*. The Sources of History: Studies in the Uses of Historical Evidence. London: Camelot Press.

- 1973 Stäblein, Bruno. "Zwei Melodien der Altirischen Liturgie." In *Musicae Scientiae Collectanea: Festschrift Karl Gustav Fellerer zum Sechzigsten Geburtstag*. Edited by Heinrich Hüschen. (Cologne: Arno-Volk-Verlag): 590-603.
- 1974 Ó Fiaich, Tomás. *Columbanus in His Own Words*. Dublin: Veritas.
- Treitler, Leo. "Homer and Gregory: The Transmission of Epic Poetry and Plainchant," *Musical Quarterly* 60: 333-372.
- 1975 Treitler, Leo. "Centonate" Chant: "Übles Flickwerk" or "E pluribus unus?" *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 28:1-23.
- 1980 Fleischmann, Aloys. "Celtic Rite, Music of the." *The New Grove Dictionary*. ed. Stanley Sadie. (London: Macmillan): 52-54.
- 1981 Hughes, Kathleen. "The Celtic Church: Is this a Valid Concept?" *Cambridge Medieval Celtic Studies* 1: 1-20.
- 1982 Pfaff, Richard W. *Medieval Latin Liturgy: A Select Bibliography*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- 1987 Warren, Frederick Edward. *The Liturgy and Ritual of the Celtic Church*. 2nd ed. Edited by Jane Stevenson. Woodbridge: Boydell Press.
- 1990 Brannon, Patrick V. "A Contextual Study of the Four Notated Sarum Divine Office Manuscripts from Anglo-Norman Ireland." PhD diss., Washington University, 1990.
In ProQuest Dissertations and Theses
<http://search.proquest.com.ezproxy.lib.uwm.edu/pqdtft/docview/303904079/abstract/136950B8C004D223DA0/2?accountid=15078>
- Levy, Kenneth. "Latin Chant Outside the Roman Tradition." In *The New Oxford History of Music*, 2nd ed. Vol. 2 of *The Early Middle Ages to 1300*. Edited by Richard Crocker and David Hiley. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 69-90.
- 1991 Gushee, Marion S. "The Polyphonic Music of the Medieval Monastery, Cathedral, and University." In *Antiquity and the Middle Ages: From Ancient Greece to the 15th century*. Music and Society. Edited by James McKinnon. (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall): 143-151.

Levy, Kenneth. "Round Table VI: The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant." *Acta Musicologica* 63: 23-24.

Walsh, John R. *A History of the Irish Church: 400-700 AD*. Dublin: Columba Press.

- 1993 Brannon, Patrick V. "The Search for the Celtic Rite: The [Trinity College Dublin] Sarum Divine Office Mss Reassessed." In *Music and the Church*. Irish Musical Studies, 2, edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press): 13-40.

Levy, Kenneth. "Round Table VI: The Iberian Peninsula and the Formation of Early Western Chant." In *Revista de Musicología* 16, *Del XV Congreso de la Sociedad Internacional de Musicología: Culturas Musicales Del Mediterráneo y sus Ramificaciones*: 435-437.

Ní Riain, Nóirín. "The Nature and Classification of Traditional Religious Songs in Irish: with a Survey of Printed and Oral Sources." In *Music and the Church*. Irish Musical Studies, 2. Edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press): 190-253.

- 1995 Buckley, Ann. "And his voice swelled like a terrible thunderstorm... : Music as Symbolic Sound in Medieval Irish Society." In *Music and Irish Cultural History*. Irish Musical Studies, 3, edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press): 13-76.

Cahill, Thomas. *How the Irish Saved Civilization: The Untold Story of Ireland's Heroic Role from the Fall of Rome to the Rise of Medieval Europe*. New York: Anchor Books.

O'Donoghue, Patrick. "Music and Religion in Ireland." In *Music and Irish Cultural History*. Irish Musical Studies, 3, edited by Gerard Gillen and Harry White. (Dublin: Irish Academic Press): 116-152.

- 1996 Scheideas, Marc. "The Origins of the Early Irish Liturgy." In *Irland und Europa im Früheren Mittelalter: Bildung und Literatur*. Edited by Próinséas Ní Chatháin and Michael Richter. (Stuttgart : Klett-Cotta): 76-97.

- 1998 Buckley, Ann. "Research Project: Music in Medieval Ireland." Email to H-mustxt mailing list, April 28, 1998.
<http://h-net.msu.edu/cgi-bin/logbrowse.pl?trx=vx&list=h-mustxt&month=9804&week=d&msg=ZqMNyZXAImpHHzAqnl8RA&user=&pw=>

- 2000 Brannon, Patrick V. "Medieval Ireland: Music in Cathedral, Church and Cloister." *Early Music* 28: 193-202.
- Buckley, Ann. "Editorial." *Early Music* 28: 164.
- _____. "Music and Musicians in Medieval Irish Society." *Early Music* 28: 165-190.
- _____. "Correspondence: Early Music of Ireland." In response to Peter Downey. *Early Music* 28: 510.
- Casey, Sara Gibbs. "Through a Glass Darkly: Steps Towards Reconstructing Irish Chant from the Neumes of the Drummond Missal." *Early Music* 28: 205-215.
- Czernin, Martin. "Fragments of Liturgical Chant from Medieval Irish Monasteries in Continental Europe." *Early Music* 28: 217-224.
- Jeffery, Peter. "Eastern and Western Elements in the Irish Monastic Prayer of the Hours." In *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography. In honor of Ruth Steiner*. Edited by Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 99-143.
- Karp, Theodore. "A Serendipitous Encounter with St. Kilian." *Early Music* 28: 227-237.
- Möller, Hartmut. "Office Compositions from St. Gall: Saints Gallus and Otmar." In *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography. In honor of Ruth Steiner*. Edited by Margot E. Fassler and Rebecca A. Baltzer. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 237-256.
- Wilkinson, Loren "Saving Celtic Christianity: Despite the Mythmaking, There's a Wealth of Christian Truth and Devotion Worth Recovering." *Christianity Today* April 24: 78-85.
- 2001 Boydell, Barra. "Evidence for Music in the Medieval Irish Liturgy: A Survey." In *Anáil Dé: The Breath of God: Music, Ritual and Spirituality*. Edited by Helen Phelan. (Dublin: Veritas Publications for Irish World Music Centre, University of Limerick): 71-80.
- Buckley, Ann. "Celtic Chant." In *Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online*. <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/article/grove/music/05266>

- 2003 Casey, Sara Gibbs. "Songs for the *Peregrini*: Proper Chants for Irish Saints as Found in Continental Manuscripts of the Middle Ages." PhD diss., University of Pittsburgh, 2003.
- Ellis, Peter Berresford. *A Brief History of the Celts*. 2nd. ed. London: Constable & Robinson.
- 2005 Buckley, Ann. "Music in Ireland to c. 1500." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 744-813.
- Hughes, Kathleen. "The Church in Irish Society, 400-800." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 301-330.
- Hughes, Kathleen. "The Irish Church, 800-c.1050." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 635-655.
- Ó Crónín, Dáibhí. "Hiberno-Latin Literature to 1169." In *Prehistoric and Early Ireland*. Vol. 1 of *A New History of Ireland*. Edited by Dáibhí Ó Crónín. (Oxford: Oxford University Press): 371-404.
- 2006 Corning, Caitlin. *The Celtic and Roman Traditions: Conflict and Consensus in the Early Medieval Church*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- 2007 Treitler, Leo. *With Voice and Pen: Coming to Know Medieval Song and How It Was Made*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 2008 Lawrence, Frank. "What Did They Sing at Cashel in 1172?: Winchester, Sarum, and Romano-Frankish Chant in Ireland." *Journal of the Society for Musicology in Ireland* 3: 111-125.
<http://www.music.ucc.ie/jsmi/index.php/jsmi/article/viewArticle/24>